January 2003

Recent Articles of Interest

Follow this and additional works at: http://digitalcommons.butler.edu/jhcs

Part of the Religion Commons

Recommended Citation

Available at: https://doi.org/10.7825/2164-6279.1309
foreign and unlikely, were strongly present in Greek thought - a major source of European civilization. Rebirth ideas were also present in small societies around the world prior to their Greek and Indian manifestations. What especially characterizes the Indian and Greek forms is the strong ethical ideas associated with rebirth thinking - the idea that the good or bad one does in this life has a direct effect on one's afterlife and on the state into which one is reborn. Through his careful and detailed reading of these seemingly quite different societies, the author convincingly shows that rebirth beliefs link Greek philosophers to Indian (Hindu, Buddhist, Jain) and Amerindian thinkers. The book thus builds a stolid bridge between Western European intellectuals (who find notions of karma and rebirth to be outrageous) and Hindu and Buddhist thinkers. While the author’s major focus on the Indian side is more oriented toward Buddhism, his analysis of the Upanisadic sources of karma and rebirth is detailed and well done - as is his study of the Greek writings of Pythagoras, Empedocles and Plato.

In Hinduism the author finds no references to karma or rebirth in the Vedic Samhitas or Brahmanas, with the first significant mention appearing in the Brhadaranyaka and Chandogya Unpaisads before the 6th century B.C.E. One hundred years later these same ideas appear in Jainism and Buddhism along with the notion of the “unsatisfactoriness of existence” or dukkha. In each of these traditions karma or ethical action is seen to fuel rebirth in heaven, hell, animal or plant forms. Since rebirth in these various forms is endless thus the need for salvation or release (moksa or nirvana) is necessitated. The author finds the same thought pattern to be present in Greek thought, especially in Plato’s Phaedo along with the Phaedrus and the Republic. Even the key role of desire in Plato’s thought closely parallels the role of desire in Hindu and Buddhist karma-samsara theories. The strength of this book, however, is not just in its comparative Greek-Indic analysis, but in the placing of karma-rebirth thinking in the larger worldwide context of small scale societies in Siberia, West Africa, the Northwest Amerindians, the South Pacific and Australia. Obeyesekere claims that while rebirth ideas are found in all of these small scale societies (and thus did not originate in India), the ethicalization of these ideas occurs only in Indic and Greek thinking. The question of influence between Greece and India in the axial period is touched on but not developed.

This well researched and clearly written book greatly added to my thinking around karma and rebirth theory—especially in widening my awareness of parallel forms in Greek philosophy and in aboriginal societies. Highly recommended.

Harold Coward
University of Victoria

Recent Articles of Interest


72 Recent Articles of Interest


Journal of Vaishnava Studies 11 (Spring 2002), 12 articles on Tamal Krishna Goswami.