1931

Changing Tendencies in the Teaching of Formal Grammar

Helen Tichenor

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.butler.edu/grtheses

Part of the Education Commons

Recommended Citation
https://digitalcommons.butler.edu/grtheses/219

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate Scholarship at Digital Commons @ Butler University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Graduate Thesis Collection by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @ Butler University. For more information, please contact omacissa@butler.edu.
CHANGING TENDENCIES IN THE TEACHING OF FORMAL GRAMMAR

A CRITICAL EXAMINATION OF THIRTY TEXT-BOOKS
DATING FROM 1829 TO 1929

BY

HELEN TICHEROR

A THESIS SUBMITTED AS PARTIAL FULFILLMENT FOR THE DEGREE OF
MASTER OF ARTS
COLLEGE OF EDUCATION
BUTLER UNIVERSITY

INDIANAPOLIS
1931
The writer wishes to express appreciation of the kindly interest and helpful counsel of Dr. W. L. Richardson.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PART I. INTRODUCTION</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I Opinions As to the Value of Formal Grammar</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| PART II. ANALYSIS OF GRAMMAR TEXTS | |
| II Physical Features | 14 |
| III Ultimate Objectives | 23 |
| IV Content and Order of Presentation | 47 |
| V Rules and Definitions | 65 |
| VI Nature of Drill Exercises | 86 |
| VII Opportunities for Creative Thinking and Writing | 101 |

| PART III. CONCLUSION | |
| VIII Summary and Conclusions | 134 |

Bibliography | 138 |
Appendix A. List of Books with Authors and Dates of Publication | 146 |
Appendix B. Definitions of Grammar in Chronological Order with Names of Grammarians | 149 |
Appendix C. Subject Matter and Arrangement As Shown by Main Divisions of Text-Books | 155 |
PART I

INTRODUCTION
CHAPTER I

OPINIONS AS TO THE VALUE OF FORMAL GRAMMAR

The question as to whether any appreciable improvement in the speech and writing of children is realized by means of a knowledge of formal grammar is debatable. The belief is more or less common among educators that formal grammar does not function to a degree which justifies the time spent upon it. That the dissatisfaction with the subject of grammar, as it is taught, is not a problem of recent years alone is evident from periodical readings throughout the past century. Interest in an analysis of grammar text-books, which is the subject matter of this dissertation, was occasioned by a previous study of the history of the teaching of grammar. As one phase of that earlier study, all available periodical literature on the subject was reviewed. These writings, beginning with the year 1859 and extending to the present time, include discussions by approximately one hundred men and women. The most striking observation made from that survey is that, although the readings cover a long period of years and the subject is discussed from many different points of view, five rather clearly
defined theories in regard to the teaching of grammar manifest themselves throughout the entire period and four of them suggest discontent with the extent to which practical value is gained from a study of the subject.

The first of these theories is that progress in the study of grammar is hampered because the subject, as it is usually presented, is almost universally disliked by pupils. Judgment is frequently passed against grammar because many of the writers apparently believed -- the lifeless character of the subject justifies the pupil in rebelling against it. In 1916 when Burgess Johnson spoke of grammar as "the bane of boyhood," he was only reiterating what other writers had said earlier. As early as 1859 W. C. Fowler had written:

"Nor is there any subject in the curriculum of our lower schools which so generally awakens disgust on the part of the pupil... The long paradigms conveying no clear ideas, and the mass of exceptions overloading the rules, make the whole study tedious."

Recurring frequently throughout the readings are similar protests against grammar because of the deadly, mechanical drudgery which its mastery necessitates. Many of the articles give evidence that the writers sympathized

genuinely with the pupil in the struggle which they seemed to believe he would have to undergo if he were ultimately to derive any value from the study of grammar.

In 1920 Robert Utter made the following comment:

"The grievance is an ancient one. The feeling which would make the grammarian's funeral a joyful occasion to most of mankind is so old that it might almost be an inherited instinct. Probably no one knows just when the trouble began. . . . Dogs have terrified cats for unnumbered centuries; small wonder if blind new kittens bristle at a whiff of the hereditary enemy. Are not nineteen or twenty centuries of pedagogical terrorizing almost enough to make a new-born child howl at a musty whiff of grammar or double its fists at the sight of a grammarian?"

The second theory presented is that success in the teaching of grammar is less assured because of the fact that many people in this country do not have high ideals in regard to correct and effective speech. On numerous occasions throughout the writings the lament is made that most atrocious English is often spoken without the slightest compunction of conscience and that the teacher is left to struggle alone against the indifference of parents and society at large as well as against the lack of interest on the part of the pupil. Typical of this complaint against careless speech habits is the statement of E. L. Godkin in 1897:

"I speak with deliberation when I say that there is no civilized country in which the people at large pay so little attention to their manner of speaking and choice of words; in which so much haggling is made with the language in daily use."

In 1906 Sarah W. Hiestand expressed similar regret when she wrote:

"How is it that with such holy traditions of duty and dignity, we stand powerless or struggle hopelessly against the tidal wave of coarse, slovenly, low-bred language, which is swallowing up our children in its flood? Must we see our dear English of former days swept under to destruction? Or is it possible we are in the wrong? Are we too particular?"

Thus the writers somewhat consistently maintained that the lack of ambition on the part of many of the people in this country in so far as their speech is concerned is an almost insurmountable obstacle in the teaching of grammar.

The third theory apparent in the writings is that correct speech in all cases is very largely the result of imitation and habit. With due respect to grammar, the writers frequently admitted that a knowledge of grammatical rules does not in any sense assure correct English. Recognition is given repeatedly to the belief

---


that the English which the child hears is a far greater
determining factor in his speech than are the text-books
which he studies. In this connection A. B. Stark made
the statement in 1881:

"Language is learned not by rules but
by imitation. The child that never hears
anything but good English spoken will be
sure to speak good English without any
instruction."6

In 1908 W. H. P. Faunce defined good English in the
following manner:

"Good English is a part of courtesy
and honor and chivalry. It is not conformity
to rules in a text-book; it is conformity to
the gentlest and noblest spirits around us
and before us. It is the manner in which
the best men and women approach one another
for intellectual and social exchange."7

Then again in 1922 C. H. Mathes commented similarly:

"The formation of correct and incorrect
speech habits is almost as purely a matter
of imitation as the acquiring of the earliest
powers of speech. . . . It is now thoroughly
established that a child may learn to use
the language with accuracy, fluency, and a
certain degree of artistic grace without
knowing an adjective from a noun or a parti-
ciple from a perambulator."8


7 The Humanizing of Study. School Review, XVI
(1908), p. 494.

8 The Changing Methods of Instruction in English.
Education, XLIII (1922), p. 76.
In like manner, many other writers minimized the value of grammar as a guide to correct speech.

The fourth theory prominent in the opinions given in these discussions is that grammar, as it is ordinarily presented, is too much an exemplification of rules and principles and not enough a study of the language as an expression of thought. Frequent complaint is made that too great emphasis is placed upon form -- formal rules and definitions -- and not enough upon the thought which the pupil wishes to express.

This dissatisfaction was voiced by W. C. Fowler in 1859:

"Before English grammar can take its place among the sciences, it must have a new growth from the germs that lie in the facts of the language and it must be allowed to spring up unembarrassed by the forms which other languages may furnish."9

In 1898 H. T. Peck expressed discontent with the method which was employed in the teaching of grammar. He said:

"English formal grammar, when taught, should be far removed from dusty dogmatism. As a rule no subject that is taught today is so poorly and unintelligently taught as English while none is actually so important as being the very foundation of every possible type of education."10

Similarly W. H. Cunningham in 1917 made the following objection to the usual method of presenting grammar:

"To begin by ticketing words as parts of speech, is to construct a labyrinth, in which the child advancing, gets hopelessly lost. Yet that is what has been done consistently by text-books on English grammar, following the principles of arrangement employed in teaching Latin; and that, largely, is why grammar has always seemed formal, dry, and divested of real utility."

In many of the articles the writers protested against making grammar a highly technical subject with obscure terminology and urged the attempt to give the pupil a feeling for language rather than abstract facts about it.

The fifth theory set forth in the readings is that a knowledge of the fundamental principles of grammar may and should be a powerful aid in giving effective expression to one's thoughts and in comprehending the written and spoken thoughts of others. That the study of grammar should hold an important place in the training of young people is consistently claimed in spite of the common belief that a knowledge of grammar will not assure correct speech. Most of the writers apparently believed in the necessity of teaching grammar. They maintained that, although the child's environment is the most potent factor in determining his speech, he

---

needs to know more grammar than he can get by the indirect method of absorption. The point is emphasized frequently that a knowledge of what is correct and what is incorrect can not fail to guide the speaker or the writer in expressing his thoughts effectively. It is asserted also that a knowledge of grammar will serve as a direct aid in the interpretation of the thoughts of others and is the surest guarantee of intelligent reading. On this subject F. A. Barbour wrote in 1896:

"Closely connected with, indeed quite inseparable from, this analytical insight into the structure of sentences, is its educational value in giving the mind the power to interpret all thought which is difficult to understand. The moment such analysis is extended beyond simple sentences to those which are long and complex it is little else than the formal interpretation of the thought. It tends at once to break up all looseness of interpretation, all satisfaction with a half grasp of thought. It strengthens the mental grip in its seizure upon ideas and so is most intimately connected with all subjects of study."\(^{12}\)

In 1915 G. David Houston made the following comment in defense of the subject:

"The pupil who can analyze a difficult sentence is very likely to interpret the thought that is difficult to understand. Whenever the pupil has a vague conception of the thought of a sentence, the trouble can usually be located by means of questions pertaining to the grammatical structure of the sentence. Grammatical analysis is

usually a sure instrument of interpretation and can be made effective in the study of any subject in the curriculum." 13

Illustrative of the attitude of many of the writers is Margaret Hunt Hetzel's statement made in 1921:

"A student should have a working knowledge of the language of the mother-tongue in order to understand the thoughts of others whom spoken or written; he should be able to express his own thoughts intelligently by means of speech and writing; he should be able to gain pleasure and profit from reading the literature of his own language." 14

Thus, with only a few exceptions, the writers advocated the teaching of grammar not only as an important means of giving the pupil assurance in his manner of speaking and writing but also as an aid to him in comprehending easily and surely the expression of the thoughts of others.

That the writings of so many different people over a long period of time should be permeated to such a degree with the same general theories or opinions in regard to the teaching of grammar appears to be a matter of significance. Considerable consequence also may be attached to the fact that four of the five theories are in disparagement of the teaching of grammar while the

writers, nevertheless, consistently cling to the belief that the subject has real value. These opinions, together with the obvious fact that grammar has continued to hold an important place in the schools, lead directly to the question: What specific development have text-books, the guides to the teaching of grammar, made during those same years? Since these educational discussions have held closely to certain uniform theories, the question naturally arises as to what extent grammarians in their text-books have developed new technique which should make grammar a more valuable study. In this dissertation, therefore, an attempt is made to answer the questions: Do text-books in grammar throughout the past century give indication of progressively increasing functional value? Does the teacher today not have a right to assume that, so far as the text-book is concerned, the pupil has a greater opportunity to acquire accuracy and fluency of expression from the study of grammar than did the pupil of a century ago? Are text-books so written that pupils, who will, can find succinctly and interestingly presented that guidance which they require to give them assurance in speech and writing?

It is proposed to examine critically thirty grammar text-books dating from 1829 to 1929 for the
purpose of ascertaining trends which are apparent in the presentation of the subject of grammar during the successive years in regard (1) to physical features, (2) to ultimate objectives, (3) to content of text-books and order of presentation of subject matter, (4) to the presentation and use of rules and definitions, (5) to the nature of the exercises provided for drill purposes, and (6) to opportunities provided for creative thinking and writing. Part II of this dissertation contains a detailed account of the analysis of these texts. The statements there made apply only to the thirty grammar texts selected for this study and not to grammar text-books in general. It is reasonable to surmise, however, that if other books were examined, the same general principles would hold true.

The text-books which are used in this survey are listed in chronological order of publication in Appendix A, pages 148-148. These books were chosen with deliberation. Each one has been in its time a well known and much used text and appears to be typical of grammar texts of its period. In date of publication they are rather evenly distributed over the one hundred years.

Part III gives a statement of conclusions drawn as a result of the analysis of the texts.
II

CHAPTER II

PHYSICAL FEATURES

The most obvious of the changing characteristics in the thirty grammar texts selected for this study are to be found in the physical features. In this chapter consideration is given to these changes.

The first note to be made lies in the external appearance of the covers. Although there is a general change from the very ornate and the very ornate latest of these texts, in the great majority of them -- drab, monotonous, and uninteresting as they are in color and in lettering -- no very noticeable differences are evident. Kirkham's rather flimsy, paper-backed volumes published in 1685 and those stiff, handsomely printed books existing in their appearances in themselves, these faded, dog-eared grammars, as they are found in the libraries, could never have been attractive in appearance. Greene's book, published in 1657, is the first of the texts to be bound in cloth. The cloth bindings, which are uniformly used after that time, give the impression of being somewhat more durable than do the paper covers of an earlier date, yet these later
CHAPTER II

PHYSICAL FEATURES

The most obvious of the changing tendencies in the thirty grammar texts selected for this study are to be found in the physical features. In this chapter consideration is given to these changes.

The first contrast to be noted lies in the external appearance of the books. Although there is marked change between the very earliest and the very latest of these texts, in the great majority of them -- drab, monotonous, and uninteresting as they are in color and in lettering -- no very noticeable differences are evident. Kirkham's rather flimsy, paper-backed volume published in 1829 and those which immediately follow have nothing in their appearance to recommend them. These faded, dog-eared grammars, as they are found in the libraries, could never have been attractive in appearance. Greene's book, published in 1867, is the first of the texts to be bound in cloth. The cloth bindings, which are uniformly used after that time, give the impression of being somewhat more durable than do the paper covers of an earlier date; yet these later
books still have the usual, unmistakable text-book appearance and can make no claim whatever to beauty of binding. Dengler's grammar in 1914 and the books which follow present a more pleasing first appearance than do the earlier texts. The difference, if indeed there is a difference, may be found in the coloring of the covers. They are slightly more colorful although they are still very dark as if the color had been chosen for its serviceable quality. Tanner's book in 1928 is the first one not to bear the stamp of a conventional text-book in grammar. The books of Tanner, Baker and Goddard, and Paul and Miller are handsomely bound, substantial looking volumes beautifully lettered in contrasting colors, books which show a touch of individuality and which by their very outward appearance invite further investigation. The significance of the change which has taken place is apparent when Paul and Miller's book of 1929 is contrasted directly with Kirkham's of a century earlier. Paul and Miller, not unmindful of the fact that the pupil will need some enticing if he is to approach the study of grammar in a pleasurable mood, have made their book, attractive and pleasing in binding, much more promising than is Kirkham's text, so commonplace and unappealing in appearance.

Far greater contrast is evident from the printed page within the books than from the outer coverings. Evidently intent upon producing scholarly treatises which
include every known fact about each topic whether within the comprehension of the young learner or not, the grammarians of the first fifty years of this study have resorted to the use of much very fine print. Each page suggests at a glance a dry-as-dust text-book made up of a mass of uninteresting detail. It is immediately manifest that this detail is the minute explanation of the grammatical principles which are occasionally interspersed through the pages in somewhat larger type. Many of the writers, not content with the elucidation provided in the body of the text, add at the lower part of each page footnotes some of which use a good share of the page. Lack of variety characterizes the books. Page after page of sameness confronts the reader -- never ending grammatical principles, explanations, exercises. Absolutely nothing is provided to break the monotony. The division headings are given in the same type as is used for the principal sections which immediately follow them. Nothing in the wording or appearance of the headings would attract attention. Such pages, regardless of the value of the printed material, are enough to tire the eyes and confuse the mind as well as to dishearten the young learner.

Although the printed page in Whitney's grammar in 1877 must be characterized as monotonous as are the grammars which come before it in chronological order,
it presents a different appearance. In his text and those which follow it, footnotes and fine print, two of the most noticeable features of the earlier books, are rarely used. Their absence prevents the books from having such a voluminous appearance, so distasteful to the ordinary student of grammar. The print, though much smaller than it should be for the sake of the eyes of the learner, is of uniform size throughout the text. Emphasis is gained frequently by the use of very black type of the same size as the rest of the printing on the page.

By 1900 considerable change has taken place in the physical features of the interior of grammar texts. The print is decidedly larger and more distinct than that in any of the preceding books. The thin porous paper, used previously, has been replaced by a somewhat better quality. In Milne's book the section headings, placed in the margin, relieve to some extent the monotony of the earlier books. As the reader turns the pages, he can see the progress of the subject matter. In the texts which follow Milne's, the division headings, which appear frequently and are given some prominence, apparently break the pages and give the impression that the text is a usable book. The sameness throughout the text is not quite so offensive as it is in the earlier books in which there is one, solid, continuous, unending
body of material.

Beginning with Dengler's text in 1914, the student becomes aware of a new tendency. The presentation of the subject matter of grammar is interrupted repeatedly with the insertion of long lists of sentences. This intimates that there is going to be much for the pupil to do as well as to learn. The number of sentences may suggest that there is even more to be done than to be learned. One wonders what has become of all the subject matter included in the fine print of the earlier texts.

By 1928 the physical aspects of the grammar texts have undergone radical changes. The smooth glaze and fine quality of the paper, the clear large print, the illustrations, the general usableness and beauty of the texts of Tanner, Baker and Goddard, and Paul and Miller set them apart from the earlier books. No feature of a grammar text could do more to make the book appeal to boys and girls than do the pictures which are found in these last three texts. Twenty-one full page illustrations, all of which are peculiarly appropriate and interesting, make Tanner's book truly delightful. The following titles indicate the nature of the pictures:

- Tug Boats in the Harbor
- Boy Scouts Practice Knife Throwing
- Camp Fire Girls Mending Toys
- An Exciting Moment in Field Hockey
A Group of Aged Toy Makers

A Successful Possum Hunt

Illustrative headings in silhouettes and lines at the beginning of each section are a distinctive feature of Baker and Goddard's text. These fascinating illustrations, each suggestive of the topic upon which the sentences for drill and the composition assignments in the section are based, add charm to the book. Only two illustrations are provided in Paul and Miller's text, but each is one which will arouse some feeling in the pupil -- an etching of the Spirit of St. Louis and a photograph of an exciting football contest. The meager-ness of illustrations in this text is fully counter-balanced by the interesting division titles which appear regularly. Even though the student turns the pages ever so hastily, his attention is sure to be attracted by the following unusual captions:

Danger! Be Careful!

In the Sentence Hospital

Do Not Be a Burglar

Stop! Look!

Fight Till You Master the Pronoun

Managing Complex Sentences

He is scarcely conscious that he is examining a text-book. Many paragraphs, which show plainly that they have a narrative interest, invite him to pause and enjoy them. In
contrast with the earlier texts, these later books give
indication that great effort has been expended to secure
the interest and cooperation of the pupil so that the
study of grammar may be pleasurable as well as profitable.
Such books will attract even the less ambitious pupil
into a perusal of their subject matter.

Still another changing tendency in the physical
features of the texts is to be found in the provision
which is made for them to be used as reference books.
Holbrook in 1873 is the first of the grammarians to
provide an index. In the earliest books the pupil is
forced to search through a long, complicated table of
contents or, more often, through the vast amount of
detail in the text proper in order to find some minor
point for which he has immediate use. It would appear
that the grammarians do not expect the pupils to have
any occasion to use a grammatical principle until they
have reached it in their texts and, after having studied
the text, they are supposed to have stored the fact away
in their minds ready to be called forth when it is needed.
From 1873 to 1900 an index is not an unusual feature of
grammar texts; yet some of the grammarians have not felt
it necessary to include one in their treatises. After
1900, however, every text contains a full table of
contents supplemented by a complete index.

Thus it may be seen that changes have taken
prominent among the features not found in the earlier
place throughout the century in the physical features of the thirty grammar texts. The books which appear at the end of the period are much more pleasing in appearance and much more usable as texts than are those of an earlier date. The century old books with their somber, conventional text-book covers have been replaced by books whose binding is pleasing enough to add beauty and attractiveness to any pupil's library. This new type of text-book, however, is not produced until near the end of the period. Changes in the appearance of the interior of the books have been more gradual. By 1877 the excessive use of fine print in the body of the text has given way to a type of uniform size which, though an improvement over the former, is still sufficiently small to fatigue the eyes of the young learner. Beginning in 1900 numerous, conspicuous section headings appear to break up the subject matter into smaller divisions and to prevent the impression, which is given in the earlier texts, that the book is one continuous discussion with no pauses and no relief. After 1914 the amount of subject matter seems to be materially reduced. Quite as prominent as the sections in which the subject is presented are the abundant exercises provided for practice. By the end of the century the grammarians seem to have employed every known device to secure the interest of the pupil and to make the book a usable, convenient text. Prominent among the features not found in the earlier
books are the excellent quality of the paper, the good print, the interesting and original headings for divisions of subject matter, the illustrations, and the indexes.

Chapter II dealt with changing techniques in the physical features of the thirty grammar texts.

Chapter III presents a discussion of changing techniques in the objectives which the writers of the texts have set for themselves and also in instructional emphasis in an effort to reach those objectives. The discussion is based upon evidence obtained by a careful examination of the authors' own statements in their prefaces, introductions, notes to teachers, and addresses to students.

The testimony of the writers themselves presents abundant evidence that the final goal of each grammarian is to give a competent knowledge of grammar which will result in correct speech and writing for practical purposes. Practical utility, the chief value claimed for the study of grammar in 1629, is the final end and aim of that study a century later. In the preface of his grammar text published in 1839 Kirkham writes:

"Its leading object is to adopt a correct and easy method in which pleasure is blended with the labors of the learner and which is calculated to excite in him a spirit of inquiry that shall call forth into vigorous and useful exercise, every latent energy of his mind; and thus enable
Chapter II dealt with changing tendencies in the physical features of the thirty grammar texts.

Chapter III presents a discussion of changing tendencies in the objectives which the writers of the texts have set for themselves and also in instructional emphasis in an effort to reach those objectives. The discussion is based upon evidence obtained by a careful examination of the authors' own statements in their prefaces, introductions, notes to teachers, and addresses to students.

The testimony of the writers themselves presents abundant evidence that the final goal of each grammarian is to give a competent knowledge of grammar which will result in correct speech and writing for practical purposes. Practical utility, the chief value claimed for the study of grammar in 1829, is the final end and aim of that study a century later. In the preface of his grammar text published in 1829 Kirkham writes:

"Its leading object is to adopt a correct and easy method in which pleasure is blended with the labors of the learner and which is calculated to excite in him a spirit of inquiry that shall call forth into vigorous and useful exercise, every latent energy of his mind; and thus enable
him soon to become thoroughly acquainted with the nature of the principles and with their practical utility and application.

In 1929, at the end of the century, in the preface of Paul and Miller's book appears the statement:

"First, emphasis should be placed on the mastery of that central unit of composition, the sentence. Such matters should be stressed as will be of practical help to pupils in handling sentences easily and correctly."

Each of the writers of the thirty texts in turn has set for himself the laudable goal of improving the speech and writing of the learner. Each in succession, recognizing the shortcomings of the books of the kind which have preceded his, is courageously hopeful that his particular book is going to bring relief -- freshness and vitality into a study hitherto dry and lifeless.

Each confidently believes that he is introducing a method which will, if properly used, tend to lead to correct speaking and writing on the part of the student of the text.

Although correct speech is the aim of all the writers, great diversity of opinion is manifest as to the best means of reaching this goal. Such widely

1Kirkham, Samuel. English Grammar in Familiar Lectures, p. 9.

divergent trends are evident as a result of changes in emphasis throughout the century that one almost loses sight of the fact that ultimately the objective is the same.

The prefaces and introductions of the earliest books suggest at once something of the seriousness with which the writers approach their task and the importance which they attach to the subject of grammar. As a result of years of study, they have come to think of grammar as a profound and valuable subject, and they attempt to instil in the immature mind of the learner the same respect and devotion for it which they feel. At the outset, they hope to enlist the cooperation of the pupil by convincing him of the inestimable value of the subject and of the necessity of complete mastery of the text in question. It is their earnest hope that the child will willingly and eagerly subject himself to the labor which such mastery must necessitate in order that he may eventually attain a far-off goal which the grammarians have set for him and for which it is his duty to strive. Interest in the following excerpt from Lecture I in Kirkham's book is heightened by the knowledge of the fact that the author chooses to call his lectures familiar lectures:

"To the Young Learner: "You are about to enter upon one of the most useful, and, when rightly pursued, one of the most interesting studies in the whole circle of science. If, however, you, like many a misguided youth,
are under the impression that the study of grammar is dry and irksome, and a matter of little consequence, I trust I shall succeed in removing from your mind, all such false notions and ungrounded prejudices; for I will endeavor to convince you, before I close these lectures, that this is not only a pleasing study, but one of real and substantial utility; a study that directly tends to adorn and dignify human nature, and meliorate the condition of man. Grammar is a leading branch of that learning which alone is capable of unfolding and maturing the mental powers, and of elevating man to his proper rank in the scale of intellectual existence; -- of that learning which lifts the soul from earth, and enables it to hold converse with a thousand worlds.

"Doubtless you have heard some persons assert, that they could detect and correct any error in language by the ear, and speak and write accurately without a knowledge of grammar. Now your own observation will soon convince you that this assertion is incorrect. A man of refined tastes, may, by perusing good authors, and conversing with the learned, acquire that knowledge of language which will enable him to avoid those glaring errors that offend the ear; but there are other errors equally gross, which have not a harsh sound, and, consequently, which cannot be detected without a knowledge of the rules that are violated. Believe me, therefore, when I say, that without the knowledge and application of grammar rules, it is impossible for any one to think, speak, read, or write with accuracy.

"You are aware, my young friend, that you live in an age of light and knowledge; -- an age in which science and the arts are marching onward with gigantic strides, You live, too, in a land of liberty; -- a land on which the smiles of Heaven beam with uncommon refulgence. The trump of the warrior and the clangor of arms no longer echo on our mountains, or in our valleys; the garments dyed in blood have passed away; the mighty struggle for independence is over; and you live to enjoy the rich boon of freedom..."
and prosperity which was purchased with the
blood of our fathers. These considerations
forbid that you should ever be so unmindful
of your duty to your country, to your Creator,
to yourself, and to succeeding generations,
as to be content to grovel in ignorance.
Remember that 'knowledge is power'; that an
enlightened and a virtuous people can never
be enslaved; and that, on the intelligence
of our youth, rest the future liberty, the
prosperity, the happiness, the grandeur,
and the glory of our beloved country. Go on,
then, with a laudable ambition, and an un­
yielding perserverance, in the path which
leads to honor and renown. Press forward.
Go, and gather laurels on the hill of science;
linger among her unfading beauties; 'drink
deep' of her crystal fountain; and then join
in 'the march of fame'. Become learned and
virtuous, and you will be great. Love God
and serve Him and you will be happy."

The earliest grammarians promise the reward of
facility in the use of language to him who has sufficient
determination and patience to master the grammar text.
Faultless speech is guaranteed to accompany such a
mastery. Kirkham, Butler, Pinneo, Brown, and Bullions
all define grammar in practically the same fashion.
Grammar is, they state, the art of speaking and writing
correctly. (See Appendix B, page 149.) The conceit of
the writers of the early grammars is unbounded. They
seem to be imbued with the idea that their texts
contain magic words which lead to success. Brown gives
utterance to his belief in the efficacy of his text
in his statement:

"The book itself will make anyone a grammarian who will take the trouble to observe and practice what it teaches." ⁴

It is plain to be seen that the book is the all important thing. Absolute, utter faith is placed in the text.

Further evidence of Brown's faith in the teachings of the book is found in his statement:

"The only successful method of teaching grammar is to cause the principal definitions and rules to be committed thoroughly to memory that they may ever afterwards be readily applied. Oral instruction may smooth the way and facilitate the labor of the learner; but the notion of communicating a competent knowledge of grammar without imposing this task is disproved by universal experience. Nor will it avail anything for the student to rehearse definitions and rules of which he makes no practical application. In etymology and syntax he should be alternately exercised in learning small portions of his book and then applying them in parsing until the whole is rendered perfectly familiar." ⁵

To be sure, recognition is given to the fact that fixedness of purpose on the part of the learner is necessary for the book to accomplish its object. Thus Kirkham qualifies the assurance which he offers to the pupil as to the far-reaching power of the text-book and warns him that he must exert a degree of will power.

---

⁴ Brown, Goold. Institutes of English Grammar Methodically Arranged, p. V.
⁵ Ibid., p. V.
He writes:

"If you have sufficient resolution . . . . , you will, in a short time, perfectly understand the nature and office of the different parts of speech, their various properties and relations, and the rules of syntax that apply to them; and, in a few weeks, be able to speak and write accurately."6

The keynote of success in the study of grammar lies in the memorizing of the text from cover to cover. Practical value from the study of grammar is guaranteed provided the book is used correctly, and correctness of use means mastery — the kind of mastery which cannot be realized from studying the book once. At the beginning of his grammar, Pinneo has the following interesting notes:

7"To the teacher:— The matter in the largest type, to which questions are appended in Roman letters, and, also, the Exercises, except those hereafter designated, are intended for recitation when the book is studied for the first time. To the teacher:— The part in small type, enclosed in brackets, [ ], and to which there are no questions, except a few in Italics, may be omitted until the book is studied the second time. It should then be carefully read, and the pupil may be examined upon it, wholly, or in part, or not at all, as the teacher may think best."7

That these early books are to be studied more than once is, in each case, taken for granted.

And so the grammarian assumes the entire responsibility for the correct speech and the beauty and the force of the language of the learner. Given the text and the determination to master its contents, the child should have no more language difficulties. The task of learning the book verbatim, step by step, and of applying that knowledge in the parsing of words is imposed upon the learner; but when that has been accomplished, the reward is assured. Mysteriously, almost magically, the young learner acquires the power of using pure and beautiful English.

Beginning with the year 1861 a change in the general tone and spirit of the grammars becomes noticeable. Kerl, in that year, appears to view the task of the grammarian from a somewhat less lofty height than had the earlier writers. Grammar, he writes, teaches how to speak and write the English language correctly. According to his definition, it does not necessarily follow that automatically without exception correct speech will result from a study of the book. The gramm-
marian claims merely to teach correct speech. Following this new trend, Greene in 1867\(^9\) and Holbrook in 1873\(^10\) define grammar in much the same fashion. In Bosworth's definition there is a still newer suggestion. English grammar, he says, teaches how to understand and use the English language.\(^11\) He is the first of the grammarians being considered to mention the necessity of understanding any of the principles involved in order to speak correctly. This new and forward-looking tendency of attempting to present the facts of grammar in such a manner as to appeal to the understanding of the learner is much in evidence in the writings of the other grammarians following Bosworth. In 1877 Swinton defines grammar in the same manner as do the earlier writers except that he uses the word science instead of art.\(^12\) English grammar has changed from an art to a science, a fact accompanied with some significance. According to the earlier theory, grammar consists of a system of rules devised by the grammarian and imposed upon the learner for the purpose


\(^10\) Holbrook, Alfred. An English Grammar, p. 5.


\(^12\) Swinton, William. A Grammar Containing the Etymology and Syntax of the English Language, p. 1.
of procuring the practical result of correct speech. According to the newer theory, the learner, directed by the grammarian, observes the language itself and as a result of this observation gains a knowledge of the facts of the language and thereby ultimately acquires correct speech. These later writers make the boast that grammar is no longer merely a mechanical memorizing of arbitrary rules and definitions.

One of the first intimations that correct speech could be the result of anything besides the mastery of a grammar text-book appears in statements made by Greene in his book published in 1867. He recognizes the fact that the English which the child hears and unconsciously imitates is really the vital force in determining his speech and of much more significance than the grammar which he learns from a book. Since the child to such a degree has formed his speech habits before he begins the study of grammar, the task of the grammarian, Greene contends, becomes largely the "uprooting of old expressions and the planting and nurturing of new ones." Greene's comment, which follows, is interesting in that it suggests the beginning of a reaction against the old practice of memorizing the text step by step and also in that it suggests the recognition of the psychological principle that the

---

individual learns by doing:

"It is not abstract principles that he wants but rather a practical use of good, well authorized expressions. These he will adopt, not by repeating rules, but by discarding the faulty and using the good. He learns to speak good English by speaking good English. He learns the use of new expressions by using them."14

A still more radical departure from the older point of view in regard to the subject of grammar is made by Whitney in 1877 when he states that "no one ever changed from a bad speaker to a good one by applying the rules of grammar to what he said."15 According to Whitney, rudimentary rules and distinctions are of value and should be taught to help children to speak accurately and forcefully. A knowledge of grammar, he claims, is distinctly helpful in speaking correctly; however, it is, he asserts, in no sense necessary for correct speech. His new and unusual point of view is best shown in his own statement:

"That the leading object of the study of grammar is to teach the correct use of English is, in my view, an error, and one which is gradually becoming removed, giving way to the sounder opinion that grammar is the reflective study of language, for a variety of purposes, of which correctness in

---

14Ibid., p. 3.
15Whitney, William D. Essentials of English Grammar for the Use of Schools, p. IV.
writ-ing is only one, and a secondary or sub-
ordinate one -- by no means unimportant but
best attained when sought indirectly."16

Worthy of note in an investigation of changing
tendencies in objectives is Swinton's declaration that
his aim is the "attainment of a fair mastery of the art
of speaking and writing our tongue."17 In the goal
toward which he is striving, he shows himself to be
more humble than the earlier writers. He contends that
grammar, as it is being presented in the text-books of
the times, is in no sense accomplishing its avowed
purpose of teaching the art of speaking and writing
the English language with propriety; and he places the
blame on the formal character of the study and the
absence of a constructive element.18 He stresses here
a thought which is to play an important part in the
efforts of the writers who follow -- the belief that
it is not enough for the pupil to observe and understand
the language of others. The pupil must, he maintains,
have drill and practice in constructing sentences of
his own and in giving expression to his own thoughts.

From this time numerous exercises in constructive
the sentence is the unit of discourse,
because words can be classified only from
their function in the sentence, and because
the pupil should, from the outset, see
these the words in the

16 Ibid., p. III.
18 Ibid., p. III.

Reed, Alonzo and Kellogg, Brainerd. A Work
in English Grammar and Composition, p. 3.
written work begin to accompany every phase of the study, and writers claim that their texts function in sentence mastery. The sentence has become the unit of study.

This new tendency of emphasizing the constructive side of grammar work is developed even more fully by Reed and Kellogg in 1877. In their preface they make the following significant statement as to their purpose:

"The aim of the book is to make the Science of Language, of which all the essentials are thoroughly presented, tributary to the Art of Expression. Every principle learned by the pupil is fixed in his memory and, above all, in his practice by varied and exhaustive drill in composition. He is constantly required to compose sentences, to arrange and rearrange their parts, to contract, expand, punctuate, and criticize them. ... Even if the study of grammar were only to lodge in the memory the forms and principles of the language, we contend that this could be done effectively only by work in composition -- this, and this only, can make them permanent possessions."19

The writers endeavor to teach the sentence not as an accumulation of words but as a tool for the expression of thought. They explain their procedure in the following statement:

"We begin with the sentence because the sentence is the unit of discourse, because words can be classified only from their function in the sentence, and because the pupil should, from the outset, see that what determines the words in the

---

19 Reed, Alonzo and Kellogg, Brainerd. A Work on English Grammar and Composition, p. 5.
In 1886 Lyte shows that he is in harmony with the new tendency in grammar texts by his explanation, in his Suggestions to Teachers, that grammar is studied in order to learn to use the language. Rigdon follows him in 1890 with the statement that "grammar is the science of the sentence, that the sentence is determined by the thought it expresses, that English grammar should be an exposition of present usage, and that a knowledge of it is indispensable to the ability to speak and write correctly."

In his book published in 1896, Wisely takes a decidedly new attitude toward text-books. He minimizes the value of the text-book itself. A far cry it is from Kirkham's faith in slavish text-book lesson learning to Wisely's contention that grammar is a subject in and of itself separate from all text-books.

---

20 Ibid., p. 6.
21 Lyte, M. O. Grammar and Composition for Common Schools. (Further reference cannot be given; book withdrawn from library because of age.)
23 Wisely, J. B. A New English Grammar, p. 11-12.
The book, he claims, can be helpful to the student only in so far as it provides appropriate sentences and guides him sufficiently so that he can think them through for himself. The text-book is more for the aid of the teacher than for the pupil. His theory is that the teacher, with the help of the text-book, should make the pupil familiar with the grammatical principles necessary for the construction of correct sentences and should give him practice in the use of the sentence as a means of expressing his thoughts.

According to grammarians' statements, grammar becomes a much saner subject after 1900. No longer do text-books demand verbatim memorization of endless formal definitions to be stored away in the mind ready to be called forth at a moment's notice. In 1900 Milne declares that his purpose is to emphasize the process of reaching conclusions rather than of memorizing them. Baker states her intention of convincing the student of the advantages accompanying the expressing of his thoughts in correct form. Not until the pupil realizes the practical use of a knowledge of the prin-

---

24 Milne, James M. *An English Grammar for the Use of Schools*, p. IV.
ciples of grammar, she contends, will these principles assist him in becoming a correct speaker and writer. In 1908 Fernald says that his aim has been "to present essentials with the least possible encumbrance of grammatical machinery." The protest against the memorizing of arbitrary rules and the repetition of them is universal among the later writers.

In the prefaces and introductions of the later texts, the importance of habits of correct speech is stressed. Full recognition is given to the fact that habit more than memorized facts counts in correct speech. Dengler in 1914 states that his purpose is to give the student better use of the English language by making him understand correct expression and then by assisting him to form the habit of correct speech by means of many carefully selected exercises. In 1917 Ward makes the statement:

"Though exposition in the text be clear, and the teacher's work be ever so vital and forceful, little will be accomplished in the pupil's mind until he has experienced the facts in a thousand sentences and reported his observations."

26 Fernald, James C. A Working Grammar of the English Language, p. iii.
27 Dengler, Walter E. Lessons and Exercises in English, p. IV.
28 Ward, C. H. Sentence and Theme, p. VIII.
By 1921 grammar, as it is presented in textbooks, has become a much more living and human subject. The more recent writers seem to give evidence of a real understanding of child psychology and an appreciation of child nature which is entirely lacking in the writings of the earlier grammarians. In contrast to Kirkham's address to students, shown on pages 25-27 of this dissertation, in which he exhorts the pupil to follow the path of duty and reap the reward which is assured, is the following appeal made by Frazee and Wells in 1921:

"Dear Tom:

"This book is dedicated to you and to Dick and Harry, and to Betty andolly and Jane as well. Why? Because quite recently each of you has been overheard to say that you 'see no sense to the study of grammar.'

"Really? Do you mean that seriously? . . . Every language has grammar and its grammar should be known by those who use it. Do you realize that your protest amounts to this: 'I see no sense in understanding the correct use of my mother tongue'? Hardly! You probably meant something more like this: 'I see no sense to learning endless rules and fine distinctions about which not one man in ten cares a copper.' . . .

"No, it isn't your slang that you regret, and it isn't that you use nothing but slang, or almost nothing. You know, as every one knows but the old fogies, that slang is often amusing, that it is sometimes apt and is always convenient; besides it shocks the proper person, and that alone is enough to commend it. But then, slang isn't necessarily 'bad grammar'; a boy may use mountains of slang yet make no error in grammar. True, he is not

Netmore, Grammar and Practice, p. XI-XIV.
likely to speak grammatically and slnguliy
too, but he possibly may. What you regret
is that every now and then you let slip
things you know to be wrong the moment they
are out, and that you are confused into
saying other things that seem to you 'all
right' but that somehow bring a light smile
to the lips of the well educated, a smile
that makes you vaguely uncomfortable, though
of course you brazen it out...

"Well, not the best book in the world
can surely correct a bad habit; even read­
ing the Bible doesn't always keep people
from sinning, apparently. And were this
a much better book than we could make, it
wouldn't keep your tongue in the straight
and narrow way. But if you are prone to
stray out of that way -- and who isn't --
this book can help you to get back into it.

"Consider! If someone were to give
you a six-cylinder touring car on condition
that you learn to know all its parts so
exactly that you could take the car apart
and put it together again correctly, and
know just the right name and use and place
of every part so thoroughly that you would
know what was wrong when the car was out of
order; would you refuse because of the work
it might require? If you stop to think, it
is quite as worth your while to understand
your language, the car that carries your
thoughts, as it is to understand a touring
car. Just as you cannot run and keep in
order an automobile without knowing its
parts and their relations to the whole
machine, so with your language: you must
begin by learning its parts as they fit
and work together in the whole sentence,
if you are to understand and use the language
rightly.

With sincere regards,
Your Friends
The Authors"
The writers seem to be speaking to real life and blood boys and girls. They know children, and they show sympathy with the child's feeling for correct English. Instead of promising vaguely that the subject of grammar will become interesting and profitable if pursued long enough, they catch the interest of the child at once and make him feel that it has an immediate purpose for him. The pupil sees that the writers are not trying to teach him stilted literary language but that they are trying to teach him to say the things which he wishes to say in such a manner that he will not be embarrassed for fear he has made some blunder.

After 1921 it is apparent that grammar is much more of a means to an end and less of an end in itself than it has been formerly. It is in a sense an incidental study to composition. Grammarians still profess to teach the use of correct English, but they try to do so by using grammatical knowledge as an immediate practical aid in original composition. Frazee and Wells make the statement that they have aimed to aid those persons who are handicapped in composition work and in the expression of their thoughts generally by simple problems of correct grammar. 30 Cross claims

30 Ibid., p. V.
that he has presented only such facts of grammar as will function directly and immediately in the speech of the child. He writes:

"No one now believes that grammar books make children's speech. This process is one of gradual growth, mostly through unconscious imitation. . . . Every child, every adult, finds it necessary occasionally to look forward as he speaks or writes and to construct consciously the sentences that are to express his thoughts. Not only is this conscious prevision necessary, but a conscious revision is just as imperative -- a revision to make what is said or written conform to the laws of good usage."

In the following words, Tanner gives expression to much the same thought:

"In order to speak and write correctly, we should have an accurate knowledge of grammar and employ this knowledge intelligently in devising and in revising our sentences. It is not enough to make a correct sentence. This we often do through imitation alone. We must know that a sentence is correct and be able to tell why it is correct."

In contrast to the lifeless memory grind of the past, Baker and Goddard, in their text published in 1928, place unusual stress upon human interest. They assume the responsibility of directing the pupil so that he will find something interesting about which

31 Cross, E. A. The Little Grammar, p. iii.
32 Tanner, William M. Correct English, p. 2.
he can write and talk. They state that the purpose of
the book is "to lead the student (1) to think definitely
upon worth-while subjects; (2) to express his ideas in
clear, forceful English; (3) to understand and enjoy
good English in the speech and writing of others."33

Emphasis is placed on motivating the work in grammar
and making it a purposeful study. Of interest is the
following statement of the writers:

"Every effort has been made to corre­
late grammar and composition work and to
make the student realize that familiarity
with sentence structure is a valuable aid
to him in comprehending thoughts expressed
by others, and in so expressing his own
thoughts that others will be sure to
understand him. Care has been taken
to give the exercises a unity of thought
or story interest that will lead naturally
and directly to the composition assign­
ments and that will help to carry the
form element over to actual practice in
speaking and writing."34

One of the newer trends in grammar texts is
to be found in the distinction which is made between
matters of maximum and matters of minimum importance.

An outstanding feature of Paul and Miller's book is
the presentation of a list of minimum essentials
which, after explanation and practice, every child is

33 Baker, Rannie B. and Goddard, Mabel. English
Fundamentals, p. VII.

34 Ibid., p. XI.
required to master perfectly. After a period of one hundred years, mastery is still required of the pupil. In 1929, however, the requirement is the mastery of a few simple and fundamental points which can be applied directly in every-day speech whereas in 1829 the requirement was the mastery of the book.

The foregoing discussion shows that, although practical utility is the ultimate objective of all the writers of the thirty grammar texts, gradual change in emphasis apparent throughout the century indicates definite trends in the teaching of grammar. At the beginning of the century grammarians appear to have implicit faith in the power of the text-book to make correct speakers and writers. The study of grammar consists of a slavish mastery of the book— the verbatim memorization of rules and principles and the mechanical application of the knowledge thus learned in parsing exercises. By 1861 the statements of the grammarians begin to indicate a tendency to break away from this belief that facility in speech is the inevitable and certain result of a sufficiently laborious study of the text. Recognition is given to the fact that imitation and habit are immeasurably more important than the text-book in directing the speech of the

child no matter what degree of perfection the child has reached in his mastery of the text. This leads to the contention that a knowledge of grammar, though helpful, is not necessary for correct speech. By 1871 unrest in the minds of grammarians is apparent. They admit that grammar text-books are not succeeding in accomplishing their avowed purposes. The objection is made that too much emphasis is placed upon the study of forms and too little opportunity is provided for the pupil to put his knowledge to practical use in the construction of sentences of his own. The writers contend that the child needs more practice in giving expression to his own thoughts and less practice in analyzing the sentences of others. By 1886 the major purpose of grammar has become teaching the child to use the language. Writers maintain that text-books, though not essential to the teaching of grammar, are valuable as guides in acquiring facility and confidence in original expression. After 1900 strong protest is made against the memorizing and especially against the repetition of rules of grammar. Grammarians hope to familiarize pupils with the meaning of certain fundamental rules and to direct them as to how they can make practical use of these rules. By 1921 grammar is presented as one phase of composition work. Writers advise the teaching of only so much grammar as will
give the pupil assurance and confidence in speech and writing and will make it possible for him to revise his work intelligently. By 1928 every effort is exerted to direct the child's thoughts so that he will have an interest in talking and writing and to make him aware of the value of giving expression to his thoughts in good form.

The separate divisions of the texts show that in all of the books published between 1829 and 1873 inclusive the old traditional subject matter of grammar with its artificial order and arrangement is presented (see Appendix G, page 281.) Even the exception of Land, each of the authors of that period has divided the subject into four principal parts: orthography, a study of the written characters of the language; etymology, a study of the classification of words; syntax, a study of the proper arrangement of words in sentences; and prosody, a study of versification. Butler in 1848 and Holbrook in 1873 treat etymology in an additional section, and Kirkham in 1869 and Greene in 1887 have devoted sections at the class
CHAPTER IV

CONTENT AND ORDER OF PRESENTATION

In Chapter III evidences of changing tendencies in the objectives which the authors of the thirty texts set for themselves were outlined. In this chapter a critical survey of the tables of contents and chapter headings is described and changing tendencies are noted in the content of the texts and in the order of the presentation of the subject matter.

The main section divisions of the texts show that in all of the books published between 1829 and 1873 inclusive the old traditional subject matter of grammar with its artificial order and arrangement is presented. (See Appendix C, page 155.) With the one exception of Karl, each of the writers of that period has divided the subject into four principal parts: orthography, a study of the written characters of the language; etymology, a study of the classification of words; syntax, a study of the proper arrangement of words in sentences; and prosody, a study of versification. Butler in 1846 and Holbrook in 1873 treat orthoepy in an additional section, and Kirkham in 1829 and Greene in 1867 have devoted sections at the close.
of their texts to what they choose to call composition. The grammarians of this early period assert that their books follow a natural and logical order of arrangement and are designed to be studied in order exactly as the subject matter is presented in the texts. In fact each division is built upon the preceding one in such a fashion that a clear understanding of it depends upon a mastery of the one which precedes. Kirkham is unique in that he combines etymology and syntax in one division. In explanation of this unusual arrangement, he admits that the rules of syntax are based upon principles unfolded and explained in etymology and that etymological knowledge is a prerequisite to the study of syntax. His justification of his arrangement is that since parsing under the head of etymology requires the application of rules of syntax, this order of presentation is the logical one.

The subject matter in Kerl's text, published in 1861, is not so different from that of other texts of this early period as might at first appear from a view of the table of contents. His most radical departure from the usual procedure in the selection of subject matter is his omission of the two common divisions, orthography and prosody, an omission which shows him any particular benefit is derived from it, and as children in many parts of the country can attend school only a part of the year, it is not surprising that they begin their grammar from year

Kirkham, Samuel. English Grammar in Familiar Lectures, p. 27.
to be in advance of the other early writers. Etymology and syntax, however, are treated in the conventional manner of the period except that they are not presented separately as two distinct branches of grammar. The two principal parts into which Kerl has divided his book he labels merely Part I and Part II with no other headings, but an examination of the chapter titles shows that each of these parts deals with etymology and syntax combined. The writer gives an explanation of this arrangement of which he is duly proud:

"In regard to the arrangement of subject matter, -- an important item, -- I venture to claim for the book a superiority over every other of its kind. . . . A language that has many inflections, may well have its etymology taught as a separate branch; but a language like ours whose actual inflections might all be printed on two or three pages, needs no such treatment. Besides words have etymology because they have syntax -- the very existence of the one implying the other; and to stop with etymology is to leave the book half finished. The greatest stickler for separating them in our language has failed to draw the dividing line; and much of the etymology taught in our grammars-- as in the case of nouns -- is sheer syntax. Every teacher of experience too must have observed how wearisome to pupils is the long desert of etymology before they see its application in syntax; and then they often do not get the full benefit of this because they have but a faint and confused recollection of the other. Moreover, by the usual system, almost the whole grammar must be learned before any particular benefit is derived from it; and as children in many parts of the country can attend school only a part of each year, the consequence is, that they begin their grammar from year
to year, get tired of technical jargon, and, finally, derive little benefit from the study. By the arrangement in this treatise, each section bears its own fruit and will be, if learned, of permanent value, whether any further progress is made or not."

It is apparent from a study of the early texts that Kerl's objection to a separation of etymology and syntax is well taken. The other early writers admit that the pupil must become familiar with the entire content of their books -- a task which assumes enormous proportions -- before any perceptible value may be realized from the study of grammar.

Each of the earliest texts is composed of formidable definitions; wordy, difficult explanations; intricate notes and remarks in very fine print; numerous examples; parsing exercises to excess; rules of syntax; and endless exercises in the correction of false syntax. The books are designed to produce correct and polished speakers and writers, and to accomplish this the authors propose to make the pupil letter perfect in the parsing of words and in the correction of false syntax. Such proficiency requires the memorizing of the text section by section. The grammarians make sure that the pupil does not neglect any detail, no

---

2Kerl, Simon. *A Comprehensive Grammar of the English Language*, p. III.
matter how complex or how trivial the detail might be. Every rule, definition, remark, observation, and caution must be at the tip of his tongue if he is to be able to parse accurately, readily, and fully — an accomplishment which is demanded if success is to be attained in the study of grammar.

Brown's text may be used to show something of the intricacy of the subject matter of the early books. Each of the twenty-six rules of syntax is presented and following each rule are examples, exceptions, notes, and exercises. All of the notes are in the form and character of subordinate rules of syntax designed for the detection of errors. Accompanying the first rule are two exceptions, fifteen observations, and twelve notes. An exercise in false syntax follows each note.

Not only for use in parsing and in the correcting of false syntax is it necessary for the pupil to memorize the contents of the book. The writers provide for the constant check on the diligence of the learner as he proceeds page by page. At the end of each division of his text, Kirkham has inserted such exercises as the following:

"What is language? -- How is language divided? -- What is natural language?"

*Quotation marks are not used when sections of the body of the text are quoted. The quotation is indicated by the single spacing, the indentation, and the footnote.
What are the elements of natural language in man? -- Wherein consists the language of brutes? -- What is artificial language?

And so follows a long list of questions which cover every detail in that section of the book.

In 1897 Butler provides for a test of the pupil's knowledge of the subject matter at the completion of each page of the text. At the bottom of the page in exceedingly fine print are questions, the answers to which require perfect mastery of the page.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Of what does English grammar treat?</th>
<th>From what are the principles of English grammar derived?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To what do these principles relate?</td>
<td>Of what does Orthography treat?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What are the names of the divisions of English grammar?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Pinneo also attaches questions to each page; and making the situation even more mechanical, he gives reference to the exact article in which the answer to the question may be found.

Questions. -- What is English grammar? See Art. 1. -- What is established usage? Art. 2. -- Under what heads is English grammar treated? Art. 3. 3

After Holbrook's book in 1873, "orthography" does not appear again in the table of contents of any of the thirty texts. Poetic art is rarely considered a part of the subject matter of a text-book on grammar. In 1897 Earle revives the word "prosody" and devotes one of the divisions of his grammar to it. With that exception, however, the name is not used again in the grammars in this study except as one of the items in the Appendixes of Milne's text published in 1900.

Although the tables of contents in Bosworth's text in 1876 and in Swinton's text in 1877 suggest a departure from the previous procedure followed in regard to subject matter and arrangement of parts, a closer study of the chapter headings shows that except for the omission of orthography and prosody these books give indication of very little originality on the part of the authors and practically no simplification. (See Appendix C, page 186.) Bosworth chooses to break away from the traditional wording and calls his first division Classification and Properties of Words. He follows, however, the usual custom of including definition, remarks, order and model of parsing, and parsing exercises. Under syntax he gives a series of definitions which are followed by rules of syntax and exercises on false syntax. Forty-three remarks giving directions for avoiding inaccuracies in the use of language appear next and are supplemented by
observations. A group of exercises is appended illustrating each of the forty-three remarks.

Swinton's book, published in 1877, is made interesting by the detail with which the subject matter is presented. After each rule of syntax are explanations and an exercise of sentences with which to apply the rule. Following the exercise in each case is a section on applied syntax. This consists of violations and special rules. Under violations the writer presents varying numbers of cases and cautions. All of this detail is given, however, in good print and in such a clear manner that the thought can be grasped readily in spite of the fact that it is presented at such length. Although Swinton has treated etymology and syntax in two distinct divisions, he has supplemented his discussion of each part of speech by a detailed exhibit of its functions in the sentence. By this means he has made the study of etymology much more intelligible than it was in the earlier texts. He has not required pupils to assign grammatical properties to words which have no sign of those properties without making clear to them the function of the word in the sentence. The author calls particular attention to his summaries, topical analyses, and written reviews at the end of each chapter. His written reviews, like those of the still earlier writers, include many questions which necessitate a mere repetition of facts memorized. Occasionally, however, the
pupil is called upon to do some constructive work which
requires thought on his part as well as an exercise of
the memory. An example of this new procedure is the
second of the following points with which the chapter
on nouns begins:

1. State the derivation of the word noun.
2. Write a sentence containing two
   nouns, the names of material objects, and
   a sentence containing two nouns, the names
   of objects perceived by the mind.6

With Whitney's book in 1877 an effort to rid
grammar texts of some of their technical complexity be-
comes apparent. Each of the writers after this date
shows a decided tendency to simplify the subject matter.
The very titles of the books suggest that the authors
have set for themselves less stupendous tasks than the
earlier writers had undertaken. The following titles of
some of the earliest books are significant: A Practical
Grammar of the English Language, A Comprehensive Grammar
of the English Language, An Analytical and Practical
Grammar of the English Language, and A Practical Grammar
of the English Language Synthetic and Analytic. The pur-
pose of the early grammarians seemed to be to present the
grammar of the English language, an undertaking of some
magnitude. The following titles of books of later dates

6 Swinton, William. A Grammar Containing the
Etymology and Syntax of the English Language, p. 25.
pupil is called upon to do some constructive work which requires thought on his part as well as an exercise of the memory. An example of this new procedure is the second of the following points with which the chapter on nouns begins:

1. State the derivation of the word noun.
2. Write a sentence containing two nouns, the names of material objects, and a sentence containing two nouns, the names of objects perceived by the mind.

With Whitney's book in 1877 an effort to rid grammar texts of some of their technical complexity becomes apparent. Each of the writers after this date shows a decided tendency to simplify the subject matter. The very titles of the books suggest that the authors have set for themselves less stupendous tasks than the earlier writers had undertaken. The following titles of some of the earliest books are significant: A Practical Grammar of the English Language, A Comprehensive Grammar of the English Language, An Analytical and Practical Grammar of the English Language, and A Practical Grammar of the English Language Synthetic and Analytic. The purpose of the early grammarians seemed to be to present the grammar of the English language, an undertaking of some magnitude. The following titles of books of later dates

---

give evidence that the content of grammar texts is less pretentious: Essentials of English Grammar, A Work on English Grammar in Which the Science of Language Is Made Tributary to the Art of Expression, The Grammar of the English Sentence, A Simple Grammar of English Now in Use, Correct English — How to Use It, Lessons and Exercises in English, Sentence and Theme, Grammar and Practice, and English Fundamentals. Grammarians no longer aspire, it would seem, to exhaust the grammar of the English language. Instead, they present only those principles with which the pupil needs to be familiar if he is to speak good everyday English, and they combine with a study of these principles practice in the use of correct speech.

The tables of contents in the later texts offer further evidence of this new tendency to simplify grammar. By 1877 much of the subject matter of the earlier texts has been eliminated. Even the time-honored names etymology and syntax have practically disappeared as had orthography and prosody at an earlier date. Some variety appears in the wording of the division headings; nevertheless without exception from 1877 to the end of the century in 1929 the subject matter of the texts is divided into the two major divisions of Sentences and Parts of Speech. The sentence becomes the basis of study and words are given consideration only as they function in sentences. (See Appendix C, page 155.)
In connection with this new and more rational selection and arrangement of subject matter, Wisely's text published in 1896 is of especial interest. He divides his text into four parts:

(1) The study of the sentence as a whole
(2) The study of the classes of sentences
(3) The study of the organic parts of the sentence
(4) The parts of speech

In the first division the pupil has many sentences of all kinds placed before him and he is led to see only their resemblances, the attributes which make them all sentences or the expressions of thought. The second section continues to deal with sentences, but now the pupil is shown that there are differences as well as likenesses in sentences and he learns to classify them accordingly. The next step directs the pupil's attention to the words which compose the different parts of the sentence, and he becomes aware of a unity in those words just as he has been aware of a unity in sentences. He finds principal words, subordinate or modifying words, and form and feeling words used merely to fill out the form of the sentence. In the fourth and last division the pupil becomes familiar with the different kinds of ideas expressed by words and learns to recognize parts of speech. By this order and method of presentation the pupil sees that gender, person, number, and case of nouns and voice, mode, and tense of verbs -- so meaningless
as presented in the older texts -- are the result of distinctions in thought.

After 1900 an ever-increasing tendency to discard much of the technical detail of the older texts is apparent. The long sections devoted to the inflection of parts of speech with which the earlier books were encumbered are no longer found. Fine distinctions are less and less frequently stressed, and an attempt is made to present only those facts which may be immediately useful to the pupil in his efforts to speak and write correctly. Not only is the term etymology no longer used, but instruction in etymology is reduced to the minimum. Usually it is called into service only as it offers some incidental illustration. In his directions to teachers in 1922 Cross makes the following significant statement:

"Since the old classifications of nouns into common and proper, collective, abstract, and verbal do not function in the process of learning to write and speak, except in two or three minor ways, it seems best not to make detached lessons of meaningless machinery. When we say that each individual name begins with a capital letter, we have given all the useful information there is about common and proper nouns.

"The agreement of the collective noun with its verb will be shown in Part III. The uses of verbals will be shown in connection with the verb, instead of being exhibited in part here, and the other uses elsewhere. This disposes of quite a lot of grammatical lumber -- all the useless classification of nouns." 7

7 Cross, E. A. The Little Grammar, p. 43.
Cross directs the attention of the pupil to transitive and intransitive verbs and to the voice of verbs apparently in order that confusion may not occur in determining the case of pronouns following verbs. No mention whatever is made of mode, the few uses of the subjunctive in conditional clauses being shown in an exercise. In his teaching directions he writes:

"Have your pupils write out certain verbs, like be, find, break, have, paint, sew, and telephone, in full for given tenses. The purpose of such a set of exercises is not that the pupils shall memorize any verb in all its modes, tenses, voices, persons, and numbers, but that they may become aware of the machinery we regularly employ to express certain shades of meaning."

This statement is more suggestive of change in the content of grammar texts when contrasted with the following statement made by Kirkham in 1829:

You may now read what is said respecting the moods and tenses several times over, and then you may learn to conjugate a verb. But, before you proceed to the conjugation of verbs, you will please to commit the following paragraph on the Auxiliary verbs, and, also, the signs of the moods and tenses; and, in conjugating, you must pay particular attention to the manner in which these signs are applied.

Then following a discussion of auxiliary verbs, signs of the moods, and signs of the tenses, Kirkham adds the note:

8Ibid., p. 84.
Now I hope you will so far consult your own ease and advantage, as to commit, perfectly, the signs of the moods and tenses before you proceed farther than to the subjunctive mood. If you do, the supposed Herculean task of learning to conjugate verbs, will be transformed into a few hours of pleasant pastime.  

Hoyt and Hoyt in 1923 give indication of a freedom in the use of the text unheard of in the earlier days when the only way to become a correct speaker and writer was to master the book step by step in the exact order in which the subject matter was presented. They write:

“We have tried to introduce a logical method of arrangement and to put together in one place all that we have to say concerning the structure of the sentence, devoting Part II to the forms of words, and Part III to some questions of usage. It is not necessary, however, to teach only one part at a time; we frequently use all four at once, giving together the construction, the form, and the use, and illustrating by the sentences from Part IV.”

In 1928 Tanner has eliminated from his text the great mass of useless technical principles incorporated in the earlier books. In addition to this, he gives recognition to the fact that all pupils do not need to study equally even all of the topics which he includes in his book. He begins his text with a

---

10 Ibid., p. 142.
11 Hoyt, Mary Wilkins and Hoyt, Florence Stevens. Grammar by Practice, p. VIII.
group of exercises for review and diagnosis by means of
which he tests the individual ability of the pupils for
the purpose of ascertaining how much and what kind of
training and drill they need in grammar and composition.
This is a significant innovation in grammar texts. Of
these test exercises the author writes:

Let us regard them as "setting-up" exer-
cises in preparation for our work in grammar
and composition for this school year. Let us
make good use of this "warming up." Being in
at the start and securing the lead by a clean,
quick "get-away" will do much to insure our
is coming in as leaders at the end of the contest.¹²


The chapter headings in all of the texts after
1900 show that exercises in the constructing of original
isolated sentences to illustrate specified constructions
are becoming more numerous. Composition, as a section
to itself in the table of contents, had been found in
the text of Bosworth in 1876, in that of Reed and
Kellogg in 1877, and in that of Earl in 1897. No very
close connection, however, was evident between the
grammar and the composition work. Not until 1928, near
the end of the period, is provision adequately made for
the practical application of the principles of grammar
in connected sentences. Tanner, in 1928, follows his
study of parts of speech as they are used in sentences
by sections on the composition of sentences; the com-

position of paragraphs, the composition of letters, and composition for immediate use. Perhaps the most effective selection and arrangement of subject matter is to be found in Baker and Goddard's text. The book is divided into twenty lesson units. Each unit is made up of two sections, the first dealing with language tools and the second with the use of language tools. Language tools are presented under two headings: words (their definitions and derivation) and grammar. The second section is composed of a composition model, a vocabulary study, précis writing based upon the model, original composition, and a reading list. Paul and Miller, in 1929, skilfully alternate each grammar lesson with a lesson in composition. Although the grammar sections are complete, they are obviously inserted for the purpose of increasing the pupil's ability to express himself in the composition lesson which follows.

The study of the tables of contents in the thirty texts, as described in this chapter, discloses a tendency throughout the century (1) to simplify the subject matter of grammar by reducing gradually the number of forms and principles to be memorized and (2) to make grammar a more purposeful study by providing an increasing amount of practice in original composition. The content of the earliest texts appears to have been selected for the purpose of producing perfect masters of the gram-
mar of the English language. No technical detail is omitted. With only one exception, all of the grammarians from the beginning of the century up to 1876 present an exhaustive study of orthography, etymology, syntax, and prosody. Each of these divisions is based upon the preceding so definitely that a mastery of the one is necessary for the successful study of the following. The only application of the facts of the language so laboriously memorized is made in parsing exercises and in exercises for the correction of false syntax. After 1876 sections on orthography and prosody are no longer included, and the old conventional terms etymology and syntax seldom appear. Although exact uniformity in the naming of the section headings is not observed, the subject matter of the grammar texts from 1877 to the end of the century in 1929 is devoted to a study of sentences and parts of speech. In the text published in 1896 a more natural and reasonable selection and arrangement of subject matter are definitely established. The writer first deals with sentences, emphasizing their similarities and then classifying them according to their differences. Next he presents a study of words as they are used to compose sentences. As the last step in the study he teaches parts of speech. The sentence, rather than words, has come to be the principal unit of study. From this time many exercises for the construction of original sentences are provided, and the pupil becomes aware of a real purpose
in the study. By 1921 the grammatical machinery of the earlier texts has been discarded. In contrast with the practice of the earliest grammarians of devoting many pages to transitive and intransitive verbs, the subjunctive mood, the conjugation of verbs, and other mechanical details is the less complex method of modern writers of presenting only such information in regard to these topics as is directly useful to the pupil in his speech. In 1928 diagnostic tests provide a means by which it may be determined in what training a pupil needs drill so that he may not have to use his time for the study of any unnecessary technicalities. Many of the exercises for composing isolated sentences have been replaced by interesting exercises in the writing of original compositions. Each grammar lesson is combined with an assignment in which the pupil is trained to put the grammar he has studied into immediate use in an attempt to give effective expression to his own thoughts. The subject matter is designed to make grammar a tool to be used for strengthening the power of expression.

1Pinneo, T. S. Analytical Grammar of the English Language, p. 5.
In the previous chapter a minute study of the tables of contents and chapter headings disclosed changes in the content of the texts and in the order of presentation of the subject matter. In the present chapter changing tendencies throughout the century in the presentation and use of rules and definitions are observed.

The opening pages of the earliest texts show that rules and definitions are matters of some consequence. Each of the first ten of the grammar texts under consideration begins with a long list of forbidding-looking definitions. In each of the texts practically the same terms are defined: language, natural language, artificial language, grammar, universal grammar, particular grammar, established usage, etc. Several of the grammarians claim that their particular treatises merit praise because of their manner of presenting rules and definitions. In his notes to teachers, Pinneo states that he has striven for simplicity in definitions. Bullions makes the following interesting statement:

Pinneo, T. S. Analytical Grammar of the English Language, p. 5.
"In rules and definitions throughout, accuracy, brevity, euphony, and adaptation to the practical operations of the school room, have been particularly attended to."²

Bosworth makes special mention of the uniformity of rules and definitions in his text.³ A careful study of these definitions in the texts themselves, however, shows that the difference between them and the definitions in other books is so slight as to make it negligible. Each definition is formal in nature and presented without an apparent purpose except to serve as a memory lesson for the long-suffering pupil of grammar.

Each section into which the books are divided opens abruptly with a definition presented in large type. The explanations, information, and remarks which follow and supplement the definitions are given in very fine print thereby making the definitions stand out boldly and prominently. The volume of detail, which is included in the explanation, accounts readily for the use of the fine print. Kirkham in 1829 begins his section on nouns with the definition:

A noun is the name of any person, place, or thing; as man, Charleston, knowledge.⁴

² Bullions, Peter. Analytical and Practical Grammar of the English Language, p. IV.
³ Bosworth, Marcus. A Practical Grammar of the English Language, p. IV.
Then in very fine print are the following detailed comments:

**Nouns are often improperly called substantives.** A substantive is the name of a substance only; but a noun is the name of a substance and a quality.

Noun, derived from the Latin word *nomen*, signifies name. The name of anything that exists, whether animate or inanimate, or which we can see, hear, feel, taste, smell, or think of, is a noun. Animal, bird, creature, paper, pen, apple, field, house, modesty, virtue, danger are all nouns. In order that you may easily distinguish this part of speech from others, I will give you a sign, which will be useful to you when you cannot tell it by the sense. Any word that will make sense with the prefixed, is a noun. Try the following words by this sign, and see if they are nouns: tree, mountain, soul, mind, conscience, understanding. The tree, the mountain, the soul, and so on. You perceive, that they will make sense with the prefixed; therefore you know they are nouns. There are, however, exceptions to this rule, for some nouns will not make sense with the prefixed. These you will be able to distinguish, if you exercise your mind, by their making sense of themselves; as goodness, sobriety, hope, immortality.

Nouns are used to denote the nonentity or absence of a thing, as well as its reality; as nothing, naught, vacancy, non-existence, invisibility.

Nouns are sometimes used as verbs, and verbs as nouns, according to their manner of meaning; and nouns are sometimes used as adjectives, and adjectives as nouns. This matter will be explained in the concluding part of this lecture, where you will be better prepared to comprehend it.

*The word thing, from the Saxon verb thingian, to think, is almost unlimited in its meaning. It may be applied to every animal or creature in the universe. By the term creature,
I mean that which has been created: as a dog, water, dirt. This word is also frequently applied to actions; as, "To get drunk is a beastly thing." In this phrase it signifies neither animal nor creature; but it denotes merely an action; therefore this action is the thing.

The writer apparently has succeeded in an earnest effort not to omit one fact in his discussion of the noun.

As has been stated in an earlier chapter, the ultimate end and aim of these early grammar texts is to be realized by means of innumerable exercises in parsing which require the continual reiteration of rules of grammar previously memorized word for word. The importance which Kirkham attaches to definitions in a study of grammar is shown in the following quotation taken from the section in which he gives hints to teachers:

"The method which they (other grammarians) have generally suggested, require the teacher to interrogate the pupil as he proceeds; or else he is permitted to parse without giving any explanations at all. Others hint that the learner ought to apply definitions in a general way, but they lay down no systematic arrangement of questions as his guide. The systematic order laid down in this work, if pursued by the pupil, compels him to apply every definition and every rule that appertains to each word he parses, without having a question put to him by the teacher. . . . The author is, therefore, anxious to have the absurd practice, wherever it has been established, of causing learners to commit and recite definitions.

5 Ibid., p. 30-31.
and rules without any simultaneous application of them to practical examples, immediately abolished. 6

The pupil must not only know the definitions and how to apply them, but he must also be able to rehearse them in a particular order prescribed by the grammarian. In the text proper after a detailed study of the noun and the verb, the author presents what he calls A Systematic Order of Parsing. Following this is the statement:

I will now parse two nouns according to the order, and, in so doing, by applying the definitions and rules, I shall answer all those questions given in order. If you have perfectly committed the order of parsing a noun and a verb, you may proceed with me. 7

Success in such an exercise can be attained only as a result of extreme diligence. After lessons in the parsing of nouns and verbs, the writer continues:

You may parse these and the preceding exercises, and all that follow, five or six times over, if you please. 8

Showing further something of the tedium necessary in such a study, the following remark appears after an exercise for parsing articles:

After having parsed these articles several times, please to read this third lecture critically, observing to parse every example according to the directions

6 Ibid., p. 11.
7 Ibid., p. 50-51.
8 Ibid., p. 54.
previously given, which will prepare
you to parse systematically all the
articles, nouns, and verbs in these
subsequent exercises in parsing.9

The grammarian, not oblivious to the fact that diffi-
culties are inevitable as the pupil attempts to re-
hearse the definitions, gives the following advice:

If you cannot repeat all the defi-
nitions and rules, spread the Compendium
when you parse.10

Evidence is given that the learner needs, as one would
expect, some prodding in order to keep him faithful to
the task. Evidently in order to keep up the spirit of
the learner, the grammarian offers the following words
of comfort:

When you shall have studied this
lecture attentively, you may proceed and
parse the following exercises, containing
five parts of speech. If, in analyzing
these examples, you find any words which
you cannot parse correctly and systemati-
cally by referring to your Compend for
definitions and rules, you will please
turn back and read over again the whole
five lectures. You must exercise a
little patience; and, for your encourage-
ment, permit me to remind you, that when
you shall have acquired a thorough knowl-
dge of these five parts of speech, only
five more will remain for you to learn.
Be ambitious to excel. Be thorough in
your investigations. Give your reasoning
powers free scope. By studying these
lectures with attention, you will acquire
more grammatical knowledge in three ... months than is commonly attained in two
years.11

9Ibid., p. 67.
10Ibid., p. 73.
11Ibid., p. 82.
Brown's text also may serve as an example of the complexity and monotony of the task imposed by the earlier writers in regard to the repeating of formal grammatical rules. He divides parsing into eight praxes. In the first praxis the pupil is required merely to distinguish and define the different parts of speech. The definitions are numbered, and in class work pupils are required to give the number with the definition to make sure that no one loses the place. In the second praxis the pupil must distinguish and define the different parts of speech and the classes and modifications of the articles and nouns. The definitions to be given here are two for an article, six for a noun, and one for an adjective, a pronoun, a verb, a participle, an adverb, a conjunction, a preposition, or an interjection. In the third praxis there is the addition of classes and modifications of adjectives, in the fourth of classes and modifications of pronouns, and in the fifth of classes and modifications of verbs and participles. The sixth praxis calls for the distinguishing and defining of the different parts of speech and all their classes and modifications. The definitions to be given in the sixth praxis are two for an article, six for a noun, three for an adjective, six for a pronoun, seven for a verb, two for a participle, two for an adverb, two for a conjunction, one for a preposition, and two for an interjection. The seventh and eighth praxes deal with
syntactical parsing which requires the pupil to distin­
guish the different parts of speech and their classes,
to mention the modifications in order, to point out their
relation, agreement, or government, and to apply the rules
of syntax. In the eighth praxis are exemplified nearly
all the Exceptions and Observations under Rules of Syntax
and the Notes. There are ten Notes and two hundred
Observations.

Whitney, whose grammar was not published until
1877, is the first of the writers considered in this
dissertation to break away from the practice of opening
the text-book on grammar with a list of formal definitions.
The page in his text gives much less the impression of
a text-book than do the pages of the earlier writers.
Whitney has given his sections numbers in true text-book
style. He has, however, used no fine print. Certain
words for emphasis are printed in a very heavy, black
type, but definitions do not give the impression of
standing out on the page as they do in the texts which
preceded his. In his section on parts of speech, he
begins at once in a simple and readable manner a discus­
sion of uses of words. He writes:

Our language, like every other, is made
up of words.

Each word has its own particular
part to play in the work of expressing
our thoughts: its own meaning, and its
own ways of being used along with other
words.
Thus, for example, sun, moon, star are the names of objects.

But shine, move, twinkle are of quite another character; they are not names; they are words which we put with names like those given above, to state or declare something about the objects to which the names belong: as when we say

the sun shines; the moon moves; the stars twinkle.12

Step by step he leads up to parts of speech in such a fashion that the explanation rather than the definition is the important matter. The definition is, in fact, the natural outgrowth of the discussion which precedes it as is indicated by the author's statement:

Thus we have the definition: A noun is the name of anything, a word that can stand, alone or with other words, as the subject of a sentence.13

This definition, placed at the very end of the discussion, is made inconspicuous.

Not only does Whitney present his rules and definitions in a new manner, but he also proposes to make different use of them from that made by earlier grammarians. In his preface he writes:

"I have also for the most part avoided the use of set rules, lest they should come to be applied mechanically. In studying the grammar of one's own language, the

---

13 Ibid., p. 11.
true end is not attained unless such
a real understanding is gained by the
scholar that he can state in his own
language the principle involved; and
he should be made, or helped, to do so." 14

In spite of Whitney's reaction against the mechanical
application of rules, he provides for considerable
practice in parsing. Apparently his mind rebels against
the repetition of rules of grammar; yet in actual prac-
tice he clings to some of it. With the first of his
exercises, he gives the following note:

"There are various styles of parsing:
a fuller style, when every detail is given
about the word parsed, with the reason for
everything; and a briefer, in which only
the matters of most importance are men-
tioned; and the reasons omitted. The teacher
must determine at any time what style shall
be expected. He will naturally begin with
the fuller, and pass gradually to the
briefer when the other becomes a mere
burdensome repetition of things well
understood and familiar." 15

The grammarian attempts, therefore, to acquaint the pupil
with the rules and principles which underlie the construc-
tion of sentences. He relieves the pupil, however, of
the monotony of excessive repetition.

In 1877 Reed and Kellogg also minimize the
value of the rehearsal of rules of grammar in parsing
exercises. In connection with directions for parsing,

14 Ibid., p. VI.
15 Ibid., p. 63.
they write the following note to the teacher:

"... You must judge how frequently a lesson like this is needed, and how much parsing should be done orally day by day.

In their Oral Analysis let the pupil give at first the reasons for every statement, but guard against their doing this mechanically and in set terms; and when you think it can safely be done, let them drop it. But ask now and then, whenever you think they have grown careless or are guessing, for the reason of this, that, or the other step taken."

Later in the same text is another protest against the usual method of procedure in parsing:

"We do not believe that the chief end of the study of grammar is to be able to parse well, or even to analyze well, though, without question, analysis reveals more clearly than parsing the structure of the sentence, and is immeasurably superior to it as intellectual gymnastics. We would not do away with parsing altogether but would give it a subordinate place.

"But we must be allowed an emphatic protest against the needless and mechanical quoting, in parsing, of Rules of Syntax."

In 1890 Rigdon writes:

"Parsing affords a good opportunity to teach neatness, carefulness, and accuracy."

---

16 Reed, Alonzo and Kellogg, Brainerd. A Work on English Grammar and Composition, p. 49.
17 Ibid., p. 183.
18 Rigdon, Jonathan. Grammar of the English Sentence, p. 64.
He makes no pretense that it aids in acquiring correct speech. He writes further:

"A reasonable amount of parsing is excellent, but it can be easily overdone. It is not nearly so helpful as exercises in constructing original sentences."  

In 1880 Ridpath claims the distinction of presenting grammatical principles by means of a new method. He calls his method inductive because he determines the principles as a result of an examination of the language itself. He places before the pupils extracts which illustrate the principle which he wishes to teach. The pupil studies the extract and, with the guidance of the teacher and brief directions in the text, works out the principle for himself. The following quotation from Ridpath's discussion of parts of speech illustrates his procedure:

Extracts -- 1. The sun is the source of all terrestrial power. His warmth keeps the deep sea liquid, and the atmosphere a gas. . . . . - Tyndall

2. Ah! then and there was hurrying to and fro, And gathering tears and tremblings of distress; And cheeks all pale which but an hour ago Blushed at the praise of their own loveliness. - Byron

3. Oh, hark! oh, hear! how thin and clear, And thinner, clearer, farther going! Oh, sweet and far, from cliff and scar, The horns of Elfland faintly blowing. - Tennyson

Ibid., p. 64.
45. An examination of the words which compose these extracts will show --

1. That many of them are the names of things.

Examples: The words "sun", "source", "power", "sea", "gas", "trumpet", "bomb", etc.

Let the student, under the direction of the teacher, go through the extracts carefully and point out every word which is the name of anything. And so of each of the other parts of speech.

The definition of the noun does not appear until the end of the section is reached. Even there, it is presented in fine print merely as a conclusion to the section.

The same general method is followed by other writers also. Lyte in 1886, Baskerville and Sewell in 1895, and Wisely in 1896 all proceed on the theory that all of the facts of grammar are embodied in the language, and pupils are given sentences and are directed to discover the rules and principles first hand.

After 1900 the tendency introduced by Whitney in 1877 to lead up to rules and definitions by simple and natural steps receives constantly greater emphasis. Each of the writers discusses his subject with the pupils in an exceedingly informal, clear manner. The writer in a sense puts himself on a level with the learner and talks to him in somewhat the same way that a teacher might.

---

20 Ridpath, John Clark. An Inductive Grammar of the English Language, p. 35.
talk to his pupils. The texts present much more variety than did the earlier books. The discussion of each of the writers is different from that of every other one in spite of the fact that they follow the same general tendency; something of the imprint of the writer himself is apparent. In the sections on parts of speech the grammarians familiarize the pupil with the meaning and use of parts of speech and then at the end of their discussions, very much as a matter of fact, state their definition. The definitions are given little prominence; as a matter of fact, the statement of them is scarcely necessary as the explanation has made the principles clear before the definitions come. The brevity, as well as the simplicity, with which the principles are presented is noticeable in contrast to the lengthy discussions of the earliest texts. Dengler in 1914 opens his chapter on parts of speech in the following manner:

We have learned that the two essential elements of the sentence are subject and predicate and that the subject and the predicate may contain phrases and clauses used as modifiers. We shall now see that the sentence finally divides into words.

According to their uses in sentences, words are divided into classes called parts of speech.

Do not ask what a word is, but, what it does.

There are many words, however, that usually have the same use; and their part of speech, therefore, is fairly uniform.
In the sentence, "New York is a large city", "New York" and "city" are used as names and are called nouns.

A word that is used as a name of anything is a noun.

In 1923 Hoyt and Hoyt's presentation of the noun is equally direct and clear. They write:

People who work get names because of the kind of work they do.

What is a man who farms called? What is a person who teaches called? What is a man who makes shoes called?

Can you think of any other names that have been given to people because of work that they do?

Words used in sentences get names because of the kind of work they do when they are making the sentences.

The dog barks.

In this sentence the word dog does one kind of work, and the word barks does another kind of work. What kind of work does the word dog do?

The word dog is the name of an animal; it is called a noun. All words used as names are called nouns; a noun may be the name of a person, of a place, of a thing, of an animal, or of a thought.

In 1929 Paul and Miller present parts of speech in the following, interesting fashion:

In a modern workshop each man has his particular place. Sometimes, of course, a workman may be taken from one

21 Dengler, Walter E. Lessons and Exercises in English, p. 28-29.
22 Hoyt, Mary Wilkins and Hoyt, Florence Stevens. Grammar by Practice, p. 1.
job and put on another, and every man is
not asked to help on each task. Somewhat
similarly, in the building of sentences
there are eight parts of speech which may
be employed. One word may in turn serve
different uses. According to their
function in sentences words are classified
into the following eight groups or parts
of speech:

1. Nouns -- words used as names.

Along with the newer practice in presenting
grammatical facts, the tendency to cease memorizing rules
becomes more pronounced. In 1886 Lyte makes the state-
ment in his preface:

"It will be seen that . . . the rel-
ations and forms of words and sentences
are to be learned by studying these rela-
tions and forms rather than by committing
definitions about them."

In 1895 Baskerville and Sewell give further evidence of
a change in emphasis in the teaching of grammar. They
write:

"Surely our noble language, with its
enormous vocabulary, its peculiar and
abundant idioms, its numerous periphrastic
forms to express every possible shade of
meaning, is worthy of serious study, apart
from the mere memorizing of inflections
and formulation of rules."

Wisely in 1896 makes an even more extreme statement when
he says that rules and definitions are not given in the

23 Paul, Harry G. and Miller, William D. *English

24 Lyte, E. O. *Grammar and Composition for Common
Schools*, p. III.

25 Baskerville, W. M. and Sewell, J. W. *An English
Grammar for the Use of High School, Academy, and College
Classes*, p. 11.
text-book for the use of the pupil:

"...only such definitions, state-
ments of facts, and explanations, as have
been thought necessary to help the teachers
in leading the child to think his way through
the subject, have been inserted.

"The definitions and principles thus
inserted are for the teacher and not for
the pupil. There is no need for committing
any law or principle of language from a
text-book."26

Brown's statement in 1856 that "the book itself
will make anyone a grammarian"27 seems far removed from
the comments of the writers of this later period. No
doubt the following remarks made by Blount and Northup
in 1914 would have seemed to Brown like a sacrilege:

"Nearly every definition in our gram­
matical science is incomplete or otherwise
imperfect. It is impossible to make per­
fert definitions for a living growing
organism like language... It is better,
therefore, that the recitation should con­
sist not of repetition of the material in
the text, but of discussion of individual
sentences, the text being used for reference."28

Ward in 1917 gives further emphasis to the tendency to
cease committing rules. He writes:

"The writer has never seen that much
is accomplished by learning definitions

26 Wisely, J. B. A New English Grammar, p. 4.
27 Brown, Goold. Institutes of English Grammar,
p. v.
28 Blount, Alma and Northup, Clark S. An English
Grammar for Use in High and Normal Schools, p. 341-342.
and rules. He recommends that the memorizing of rules be sparingly required.  
In connection with his discussion of parts of speech, Cross makes the following significant statement in 1922:

"It is not very important to know a faultless definition of each of these; but it is helpful to one who wishes to speak and write accurately and easily to be able to recognize each part of speech readily."  

Although this is fast losing favor, parsing exercises for a much easier type than previously used appear regularly through the texts of Baker in 1907, Fernald in 1909, and Hoyt and Hoyt, 1923. Hoyt and Hoyt add their protest against the useless memorizing of rules. They write:

"The existing grammars are difficult and ineffective largely because they insist on logically consistent definitions. A child who can easily understand what a noun or a verb really does, becomes confused by the number of words necessary to a perfect definition. . . . Why not attack English as it is and evolve grammar in practice? Why not, moreover, force the child, so anxious to escape thought, so ready to learn a form of words, to think the thing through for himself, to find out what the word is doing in the sentence, and to make his own definition?"

Throughout the later texts many exercises call for a knowledge and understanding of grammatical principles, but very few call for the repeating of iron-clad rules and none call for a mere rehearsal of them. Parsing, the Texts of Ward in 1917, Frase and Wells in 1921, and Hoyt, Mary Wilkins and Hoyt, Florence Stevens, Op. cit., p. VII-VIII.

29 Ward, C. E. Sentence and Theme, p. VIII.
which has been on the decline, is looked upon with more and more displeasure and receives increasingly less attention after 1900. In that year Milne writes:

"Parsing and diagramming, which have come somewhat into disrepute through abuse or misapprehension of their province and use, have been given due consideration as formulas of investigation and analysis expression." 32

Although parsing is fast losing favor, parsing exercises (of a much saner type than previously used) appear regularly through the texts of Baker in 1907, Fernald in 1908, and Blount and Northup in 1914. Dengler in 1914, however, breaks completely away from the old traditional custom and includes no parsing exercises in his text. After that time such exercises have practically disappeared from the pages of the texts of this study. As late as 1923 Hoyt and Hoyt refer to certain of their exercises as parsing exercises. That parsing to them is a very different procedure from the earlier exercises is evident from the following note: "Parse means to tell all you have learned in your grammar about every word in the sentence." 33

Parsing is given some consideration in the Appendix of the texts of Ward in 1917, Frazee and Wells in 1921, and Tanner in 1928. No parsing whatever is included in the

32 Milne, James. An English Grammar for the Use of Schools, p. V.


The preceding discussion gives evidence of gradual change in grammar text-books in the presentation and use of rules and definitions. The earliest writers have made definitions the most conspicuous feature of their texts. The great number of them and the prominence they are given on the page suggest at once something of the significance which grammarians attach to them. They form the nucleus around which the subject of grammar is presented. The parsing exercises and exercises for the correction of false syntax compel the pupil to commit to memory each of the definitions in turn with all of its many exceptions. Beginning with 1877 emphasis shifts. Understanding the principle set forth in the rule becomes a more vital factor than being able to repeat the rule in the words of the grammarian. The definition is presented only after it has been made self-evident from explanation and discussion. Writers begin to protest against requiring pupils in parsing exercises to repeat over and over rules with which they are perfectly familiar. After 1900 fewer rules and definitions are presented and their importance is minimized. No great value is placed upon the ability to repeat a definition. Exercises in parsing appear less frequently and are much more brief in requirement than they were earlier. The first of the grammarians to provide no exercise of any kind in parsing appears in
1914. From that time until the end of the century in 1929 none of the grammarians require the rehearsing of rules of grammar. The latest grammarians attempt to familiarize the pupil with the principles of grammar so that he may be able to recognize and understand correct English and be able to use it intelligently himself. Numerous exercises in practice in the use of correct English necessitate the understanding of principles of grammar, but no exercises require the memorizing of those principles.

"Interest in the study, it is hoped, is assured by the variety and attractive nature of the exercises." It would seem that the writers have spared no pains in selecting sentences which they hope will bring to their books the commendation of the serious-minded scholars of

1Tinoco, T. S. *Analytical Grammar of the English Language*, p. 8.
Chapter V traced changing tendencies in the manner of presenting rules and definitions and the use which was made of them. Chapter VI discusses evidences of change in the nature of the sentences used in illustrative exercises.

The sentences which are provided for practice in parsing in the texts dating from 1829 to 1877 offer an interesting study. In view of the fact that exercises in parsing play such an important part in these early books, it is not surprising that the sentences used for this purpose are the result of considerable thought on the part of the grammarians. In their notes and prefaces, they point with satisfaction to the nature of the sentences in their exercises. Pinneo writes:

"Interest in the study, it is hoped, is secured by the variety and attractive nature of the exercises."

It would seem that the writers have spared no pains in selecting sentences which they hope will bring to their books the commendation of the serious-minded scholars of

---

1Pinneo, T. S. Analytical Grammar of the English Language, p. 5.
the day. They have assumed not only the task of teaching the principles of the language, but they have also undertaken to direct the pupil's mind to noble thoughts. Many of the sentences teach a lesson or present a moral which exalts the virtues of the young. They are of a serious, almost lofty, nature. Brown makes the following interesting statement in regard to the exercises in his text:

"In drawing his illustrations from the stores of literature, the grammarian may select some gems of thought, which will fasten on the memory a worthy sentiment, or relieve the dullness of minute instruction. Such examples have been taken from various authors and interspersed through the following pages."

"The moral effect of early lessons being a point of utmost importance, it is especially incumbent on all those who are endeavoring to confer the benefits of intellectual culture, to guard against the admission or inculcation of any principle which may have an improper tendency, or be ultimately prejudicial to those whom they instruct. In preparing this treatise for publication, the author has been solicitous to avoid everything that could be offensive to the most delicate and scrupulous reader; and, of the several thousands of quotations given, he trusts that the greater part will be considered valuable on account of the sentiments they contain."

In spite of the exceedingly favorable comments which the writers themselves make in regard to their exercises,

---

2 Brown, Goold. Institutes of English Grammar Methodically Arranged, P. VII-VIII.
the sentences for the most part seem to present day teachers ill adapted to excite in the young student an interest in the task of parsing and a love for the subject of grammar. The writers make no attempt to appeal to the natural normal interests of the boys and girls who are to use the books. The sentences do contain many worthy sentiments; but it is very questionable whether the dull, laborious task of mechanical parsing would place the pupil in a receptive mood for the moral teachings which the sentences contain and of which the grammarians are inordinately proud. The following are illustrative of many of the sentences which appear in the early texts:

To correct the spirit of discontent, let us consider how little we deserve.

To seek God is wisdom.  
Young man, if you wish to be respected, you must be more assiduous.  
Falsehood is a most odious vice.  
All men should obey the commands of their Heavenly Father.  
Death brings happiness to good men.  
Prayer leads the heart to God and He always listens.


4 Ibid., p. 160.

Industry secures health, and contentment, and happiness. 6

We should conquer all our evil passions. 7

Sincerity and truth form the basis of every virtue.

Virtue, diligence, and industry, joined with good temper and prudence, must ever be the surest means of prosperity. 8

I shall henceforth do good and avoid evil, without respect to the opinions of men; and resolve to solicit only the approbation of that Being, whom alone we are sure to please by endeavoring to please Him. 9

A trifling gift, a little kindness goes a great way and is long remembered. 10

To err is human; to forgive, divine. 10

The good desire to know, and strive to obey, the will of God. 11

It is delightful to see a young person, besiged by powerful temptations on every side, acquit himself gloriously, and resolutely hold out against the most violent assaults; to behold one in the prime and flower of his age, courted by pleasures and honors, by the devil, by all the bewitching vanities of the world, reject them all, and cleave steadfastly unto God. 11

Keep thy spirit pure from worldly taint by the repellent strength of virtue. 12

---

7. Ibid., p. 125.
9. Ibid., p. 144.
12. Ibid., p. 81.
Beginning with Whitney's text in 1877, the exercises which are supplied for drill purposes take on a new tone. He and the writers which follow him seem less prone to exhibit a moral than were the earlier grammarians. The illustrations are for the most part simple, clear, understandable sentences, the purpose of which is nothing more than to illustrate the principle which is being taught. In this connection Whitney writes:

"In the body of the work I have preferred to use almost exclusively illustrations made off hand because such seemed to me more desirable; the more familiar and everyday the exemplification of principles, the better; and the pupil should be led to form them for himself as much as possible."\(^{13}\)

Permitting pupils to write original sentences as illustrations of points under discussion is a new step in grammar text-books and one which leads to much greater simplicity in sentences. From this time the exercises of having pupils write their own sentences is adopted to a greater and greater extent. In the sentences which are supplied by the writers, there is no continuity of thought, nothing which would tend to attract and hold the interest of the pupil; yet the thought is within

\(^{13}\)Whitney, William D. Essentials of English Grammar for the Use of Schools, p. VI.
the range of his understanding and appreciation. The following, taken from Wisely's text published in 1896, may suggest the nature of the sentences found in the texts of this period:

- The house is made of brick.
- The cup and spoon were presents.
- The horse is a useful animal.
- The girl's cheeks are rosy.
- The man placed his hand on the boy's head. [14]

An examination of the sentences in Milne's text published in 1900 gives indication of a changing tendency again in the nature of the sentences used in exercises. Milne, Baker, Fernald, and Blount and Northup use almost exclusively sentences selected from literature. Following each of the sentences is the name of the author from whose writing the quotation is taken and in some instances the title of the selection is given also. The following taken from Fernald's text, published in 1908, may serve as examples of the sentences used:

- The little dogs and all, Tray, Blanche, and Sweetheart, see, they bark at me.
  --Shakespeare, King Lear, act iii, s. 6
- Thou hast seen a farmer's dog bark at a beggar?
  --Shakespeare, King Lear, act iv, sc. 6
- Wood-pigeons cooed there, stock-doves nestled there; My trees were full of songs and flowers and fruit.
  --Christine G. Rossetti, From House to House, st. 7
- There sits a robin on the old elm tree,
  And with such stirring music fills my ear,

[17] Ibid., p. IV.
I might forget that life had pain or fear. —Anna Maria Wells, The Old Elm Tree

These grammarians give expression to their belief in the value and far-reaching effect of the use of literary language to exemplify the principles of grammar. Milne states in his preface that his purpose has been "to use illustrative sentences of such value in giving pleasure and in stimulating thought that the pupils will be led into a love for grammar and thence into a love for literature,"16

Question at once arises in the mind of the reader as to the soundness of the theory that a pupil might be attracted to literature by sentences with which he is required to struggle in a grammar assignment. Milne adds the statement:

"Great care has been exercised in selecting sentences that should be at once opposite for illustration, rich in thought, and healthful in sentiment. It is, perhaps, not a vain hope that some of these literary gems may prove potent factors in quickening and refining the literary taste of pupils and in giving to their thoughts rich coloring, thus awakening a great interest in the treasures of literature and an eager craving for them."17

The sentences are, to be sure, carefully selected quotations from good authors. The pupil in most instances, however, must necessarily be unfamiliar with the selection.


16 Milne, James M. An English Grammar for the Use of Schools, p. III.

17 Ibid., p. IV.
from which the quotations are taken. As the sentences appear in the grammar book without their context much of the beauty of the thought is lost. It is difficult to understand how such isolated sentences could have much possibility of "awakening a great interest in the treasures of literature and an eager craving for them."

Furthermore, the exclusive use of quotations from literature seems to suggest that the principles in grammar apply only to literary language, a language which is in a sense foreign to the one which the child knows and uses.

As might be expected, after a time grammarians revert again to a more simple mode of expression in their illustrative exercises. By 1914 they are using simple everyday illustrations. The unadorned, commonplace sentences in Dengler's text which appeal to the untrained mind of the child are in striking contrast to the more scholarly sentences in the grammars which appeared shortly before. In one of his exercises, for instance, he uses the following sentences:

A great writer reveals himself everywhere.
Can one desire too much of a good thing?
How far is it to the next station?
The boat moves slowly down the river.

---

18 Loc. cit.
19 Dengler, Walter E. Lessons and Exercises in English, p. 96.
Although the exercises in Dengler's text and in the texts of the writers who immediately follow him are composed of sentences without any connection with each other or any story interest whatever, at least the pupil is given practice with sentences the content of which has a definite meaning to him. On this point Ward writes in 1917:

"True practice is not furnished by a hit-or-miss list of selections from literature. Hence the writer has gathered sentences and passages that have plain, human content and that are really adapted to the needs of high school students."20

Frazee and Wells in 1921 supply two types of exercises -- the literary and the colloquial -- so that the pupil may have some contact with both. The child experiences any value, therefore, which may be attached to literary quotations, and at the same time he has the opportunity of dealing with the sort of language which he and his classmates use everyday. The grammarian adds zest to the study of grammar by means of the human content of the sentences as is shown by the following example:

Oh look! There goes Gabraith Rogers flying over the Maryland Hotel. He is throwing something down to the people in front of the hotel. Let's run and see what it is. Oh! he is coming nearer. See! he is dropping roses. Hurry! or he'll land before we get there.21

20Ward, C. W. Sentence and Theme, p. VIII.
21Frazee, Susan Isabel and Wells, Chauncey Wetmore. Grammar and Practice, p. 7.
The pupil sees that colloquial language is just as correct as is literary language and that grammatical principles are directly applicable in his everyday conversation. Cross, as well as Frazee and Wells, presents both types of exercises with emphasis on the more informal type.

The exercises in Hoyt and Hoyt’s text published in 1923 are somewhat different from any studied so far. The sentences of most of the prose exercises are taken from a literary selection, but they have been rewritten and adapted to the needs of the occasion. Poetry is used for many of the exercises. In each instance either an entire poem is used or a quotation is given which is complete in thought. The authors write:

“...In this book grammar is taught by means of sentences taken from books we should like our children to know; long experience convinces us that the finding of a familiar passage in a new poem or book brings a joy of which we should not deprive them.”

The selections are very different from the detached literary quotations in the earlier books. There is some continuity between the sentences of many of the exercises thereby making the lesson interesting. The following is an example of the exercises:

22 Hoyt, Mary Wilkins and Hoyt, Florence Stevens. Grammar by Practice an Aid to Thinking and Writing, p. VIII.
But the boy from Netherlands had not been born and brought up in the muscle-building air of the Dutch dikes for nothing. The American spirit of initiative had entered deep into the soul of Edward Bok. The boy was almost dazed at the instantaneous transformation of the man. Eventful day after eventful day followed in Edward's Boston visit.

---Adapted from A Dutch Boy Fifty Years Ago.23

Tanner in 1928 follows a plan different from that of the writers preceding him. His sentences for drill are not literary quotations, nor is there the slightest continuity of thought between them. In this latter sense his exercises resemble those in some of the earlier texts. An examination of the sentences, however, shows that they are radically different from any used by earlier writers. They do not appear to have been written with the thought of entertaining the pupils; yet they are full of human interest. They are brief and clear and without exception admirably suited to illustrate grammatical principles, this after all being their chief purpose. Many of the sentences in Paul and Miller's text are composed of detached but very usable sentences much after the order of those in Tanner's book. Interspersed through their book, however, are many exercises in paragraph form with a definite story element which should appeal to the high school boy or girl. The following is an example of

23 Ibid., p. 152.
these exercises:

(1) Yesterday I had my first fight.
(2) Since I am a new pupil in this school, the boys had to initiate me. (3) One tall fellow shoved me off the side walk, and I shoved him into a ditch. (4) That started the fight. (5) He was big and stout, but I knew more about boxing and was quicker on my feet. . . .

Of the thirty grammar texts examined, that of Baker and Goddard has made the most satisfactory and attractive provision for drill by exercises. The authors write:

"Care has been taken to give the exercises a unity of thought or story interest that will lead naturally and directly to the composition assignments and that will help to carry the form element over to actual practice in speaking and writing."

As was stated in an earlier chapter of this dissertation, the book is divided into lesson units, each unit being composed of both composition and grammar and each dealing throughout with a general subject. Each of the exercises consists of sentences suggested to the authors by some piece of literature, and the subject matter of each exercise is peculiarly appropriate and apt in that section.

In the section entitled "Mealt ime," for instance, the sentences in the exercise are based upon the breakfast prepared for Clifford in Hawthorne's *House of Seven Gables*; in the section entitled "Myself" one exercise is suggested by Franklin's *Autobiography* and Poor Richard's Maxims and a second one by Bok's *A Dutch Boy Fifty Years Ago*; and in the section entitled "My Country", Roosevelt's *Winning the West* and Hale's *A Man Without a Country* have been brought into use. And so throughout the book the content of each exercise bears directly upon the subject which is of particular interest to the pupil in that section of the book. In a clever fashion the writers hold the attention of the pupil by means of sentences which are excellent illustrations of the grammatical principles which are being studied. The following are the opening sentences of the exercises in the "Mealt ime" section:

1. The fish peddler's conch was heard in the street.
2. Poor old Hepzibah was searching earnestly for a recipe.
3. This maiden lady heaped wood into the fireplace.
4. The last lingering dusk in the room was driven out by the fire.
5. Willing, happy Phoebe was bustling about the kitchen.

An examination of the illustrative exercises in
the thirty grammar texts shows, therefore, a continuous change throughout the century in the nature of the sentences used. The grammarians before 1877 provide sentences many of which are extremely formal and dignified in character. Apparently they are designed to serve the double purpose of giving practice in grammar and of leading the pupil by their moral teachings to accept duty, no matter how irksome, in order that he may become virtuous.

In 1877 a reaction comes against this tendency to direct the morals of the child by means of exercises in grammar. In the text-books from 1877 to 1900 the writers use familiar, everyday sentences which seem to have no purpose other than to illustrate points taught. In 1900 grammarians return again to a more pretentious kind of exercise. Their illustrations are quotations from literature, and grammar becomes almost exclusively a study of literary language. By 1914 the tendency to use simple sentences of an informal nature has again become prevalent. From this time until the end of the century in 1929 the exercises give indication that the grammarians are striving to make grammar a more natural, human subject than it was formerly even at the expense of making their texts seem less learned and impressive. After 1921 the writers seem to make an especial effort to catch and hold the interest of the pupil by means of exercises which have a story interest running through them. The grammarians accept child nature as it is and make their appeal to children
rather than to adults. The exercises consist of lively, interesting sentences which attract the child and make the grammar lesson less pedantic and more purposeful than did the artificial exercises in the earliest grammar texts.
Chapter VII

Opportunities for Creative Thinking and Writing

The thirty grammar texts have been studied so far for evidence of the development of changing tendencies (1) in the physical features of the books, (2) in objectives, (3) in content and presentation of subject matter, (4) in the presentation and use of rules and definitions, and (5) in the exercises provided for drill. Chapter VII presents a continuation of the study of changing tendencies. The study in this chapter is directed to evidence of change in opportunities for creative thinking and writing by provision for original application of the principles of grammar.

In this dissertation nothing has been said to this point regarding any sort of creative work on the part of the pupil. All attention has been directed to the material which the grammarians themselves have supplied in the texts and the requirements made for the mastery of that material. Some of the earliest writers -- namely, Kirkham, Butler, Brown, and Kerl -- apparently think that no creative work is essential. This branch of study to them consists of an exercise in the mastery of the principles of grammar without any original application of these principles. Grammar is taught as the art of speaking and writing with precision. The text-books themselves, however, make numerous attempts at original work for the pupil. All attention has been directed to the material which the grammarians themselves have supplied in the texts and the requirements made for the mastery of that material. Some of the earliest writers -- namely, Kirkham, Butler, Brown, and Kerl -- apparently think that no creative work is essential. This branch of study to them consists of an exercise in the mastery of the principles of grammar.
of the principles of grammar as set forth in the book without any drill whatever in the original application of these principles. Grammar is defined as the art of speaking and writing with propriety. A study of the text-books themselves, however, shows that grammarians attempt to teach how to speak correctly but make not the slightest effort to teach their pupils to speak correctly. The writers do not possess even enough human curiosity to wish to try out their pupils to see how successful their system of teaching really is. No provision is made for attempting to put the principles taught into practical use even by requiring the construction of original sentences. To be sure, Kirkham has placed the title "Composition" at the beginning of a small section of the book. Under this heading in fine print he writes:

It may be laid down as a maxim of eternal truth, that good sense is the foundation of all good writing. One who understands a subject well, will scarcely write ill upon it.

Rhetoric, or the art of persuasion, requires in a writer, the union of good sense, and a lively and chaste imagination. It is, then, her province to teach him to embellish his thoughts with elegant and appropriate language, vivid imagery, and an agreeable variety of expression.

Then follow high sounding, difficult definitions of perspicuity and precision under the larger topic style

---

and of unity, clearness, strength, and harmony under the topic structure of sentences. For example he writes:

**Precision, from praecidere, to cut off, signifies retrenching all superfluities, and pruning the expression in such a manner as to exhibit neither more nor less than an exact copy of the ideas intended to be conveyed.**

The reader is at once impressed with the unnecessary complexity of the wording of the definitions. The thought, simple enough in itself, is expressed in such ornate language that the pupil would have difficulty in grasping it. The section ends with this rehearsal of definitions.

Absolutely no composition assignments are provided. Just what use the pupil is to make of these formal, elaborately worded definitions the reader is forever in doubt. They, like rules of grammar, evidently are to be memorized and stored away in the memory ready to be called forth and in some magic fashion put into immediate practical use at some future time when the learner wishes to speak with especial precision or clearness.

In 1850 Pinneo writes in his introduction:

"Composition is taught in all its elementary principles, and the construction of sentences is introduced at the commencement, and continues throughout the book."

As a matter of fact, however, in spite of this assurance
from the author, no provision is made in the book itself for the writing of any original connected sentences. The author does provide numerous exercises in which the pupil is required to complete sentences by filling in blanks with nouns, pronouns, verbs, and the like, and others in which he is required to construct many short disconnected sentences as illustrations of principles under consideration. To this extent Pinneo is in advance of Kirkham and Butler, the two grammarians who precede him in chronological order, and of Brown and Kerl, the two who follow him, since each of them has ignored the possibility of exercising the pupil's power in any kind of original expression.

Throughout the body of his text Bullions, whose book was published in 1862, has made no assignments for the constructing of original sentences. Like Kirkham, nevertheless, he has devoted a section at the close of the book to composition. Though his presentation of this subject is like Kirkham's in its formality and unusable qualities, it is much more comprehensive. He opens the chapter with the following:

1119. Composition is the art of expressing our sentiments in spoken or written language. It is of two kinds, Prose and Poetry.4

He follows this by statements in fine print regarding prose, poetry, direct discourse, and indirect or oblique discourse. Each statement is catalogued by a paragraph number: 1120, 1121, 1122, and so on. Next in a long expository section he explains that the chief business of grammar is to lead to attainment in composition and that grammar, after all, is merely a compilation of rules determined by good usage. This leads to his next division in which he expounds at some length upon the subject of Good Usage displaying many canons and rules which are to be memorized. After the pupil has committed to memory all of these minute language niceties, he comes to a section headed Hints for Correct and Elegant Writing. Not until the pupil has learned the definitions of purity, propriety, precision, etc. is he prepared to write what the grammarian calls "regular themes." Under the heading Themes the writer continues:

1164. The next step in composition is the writing of regular themes. The subject, however, should always be such as is not above the capacity of the person who is desired to compose, for, if it is, the whole benefit resulting from the exercise will be nullified.

1165. A theme is a regular set subject upon which a person is required to write; or the dissertation that has been written upon such a subject. Some of the simplest subjects for themes are those drawn from natural history, or natural philosophy. At all events they should not, in the first instance, be drawn from subjects of an abstruse and abstract character.
1166. The following may serve as specimens in this department:—

Theme I - The horse. 1. Describe what sort of animal the horse is. 2. Tell some of the different kinds. 3. Mention the various ways in which this noble animal is serviceable to man. 4. State what would be the consequence of wanting him. 5. Mention the treatment to which he is entitled, and the cruelty of ill-using such a creature.

Write themes upon the cow, the dog, the sheep, poultry; and follow the same plan as that followed in writing upon the horse.

In like manner Theme 2 deals with the sun, Theme 3 with day and night, Theme 4 with composition, Theme 5 with company, Theme 6 with narratives, Theme 7 with remarkable events in sacred or profound history, and Theme 8 with distinguished characters in the different ages of the world. In section 1167 the author lists one hundred thirteen subjects all of which are as uninteresting, abstract and incapable of being used as theme subjects for children as are the first twenty which follow:

1. On Attention
2. " Adversity
3. " Arduor of Mind
4. " Art
5. " Attachment
6. " Anger
7. " Air
8. " Benevolence
9. " Beauty
10. " Biography

Bullions' section on composition is significant in that he is the first of the grammarians actually to

5Ibid., p. 243.
6Ibid., p. 244.
provide for the writing of original composition. Theme writing is clearly an artificial, unnatural procedure with him. He suggests that it is an unpleasant exercise when he states that "a theme is a regular set subject upon which a person is required to write." 7 Since there are so many topics about which a child has a keen interest, it seems inconceivable that Bullions would select so many subjects about which the pupil would know so little and would have so little inclination to write. Bosworth's text in 1876 is the next one after Bullions', which contains a complete chapter devoted to composition. The following diagram of theme subjects taken from Bosworth's work shows that to him composition is the same lifeless, formal, rhetorical exercise that it was to Bullions sixteen years earlier.

137. Diagram

I Simple Subjects

| Horse   | 1. Where found                  |
| Cow     | 2. Description                  |
| Hog     | 3. Nature (Wild or domestic)    |
| Sheep   | 4. Subsists upon what           |
| Dog     | 5. Use                         |
| Lower Animals | (Cat to punctuate their) (Long or short) |
| Lion    | 6. How should animals be treated |
| Camel   |                                |
| Monkey  |                                |

(Classified and similar diagrams are made for the following topics: Vegetable Kingdom, Mineral Kingdom, Man, Professions, and Trades or Occupations.)

7 Ibid., p. 243.

8 Ibid., p. 110.
II Abstract Subjects

Peace 1. Definition
War 2. Origin
Life 3. Universality
Disease 4. Right or Wrong
Death 5. Former and present views
Prayer 6. Benefits or evils
Ambition 7. Conclusion
Pride
Gambling

Bosworth does not enter into such a detailed discussion of rhetorical excellencies as Bullions does. He begins with short definitions of Composition, Prose, and Verse, dividing Prose Composition into Narratives, Letters, Essays, History, Biography, Memoirs, Philosophy, Sermons, Novels, and Speeches. Each of these divisions is explained briefly. In the following explanatory paragraph Bosworth accounts for the brevity of the chapter:

"In an English grammar designed for a text-book, it is not necessary to treat in full of the styles in prose composition. The following article is intended to assist beginners in writing essays, and may be introduced by the teacher at any time he thinks best. If the pupils have studied the preceding part of this book, they should be required to punctuate their essays properly; then the words should be classified and parsed, and the sentences analyzed. It is not necessary to give an extensive list of subjects. In addition to these subjects found in the following diagrams, the teacher should suggest such as are applicable to the attainment of his pupils."

---

9 Ibid., p. 110.
In his statement above, Bosworth shows that after all even in his composition assignments he has a classificatory interest. The task imposed upon the learner is not light. That the author, forgetting the point of view of the pupil, is lost in the intricacy of his subject is evident when, after imposing upon the pupil the drudgery of composing a theme on such a weighty subject, he requires him to tear apart the sentences, so laboriously constructed, for the arduous task of classifying and parsing each word.

In one particular, however, Bosworth is in advance of Bullions. Early in his text are exercises which call for the pupil to test out his understanding of grammatical principles by attempting to illustrate them with sentences of his own composition. The author inserts the following note which is significant in the study of changing tendencies in opportunities for creative thinking and writing:

"The teacher should require frequent exercises in writing. He should introduce all the principles in orthography and punctuation that are necessary in the progress of the work. The proper use of capitals, correct spelling, and the punctuation of short sentences, should be taught from the beginning. The blackboard, slates, or paper may be used to suit the circumstances."10

This provision for making first-hand use of principles

10 Ibid., p. 10.
taught is a new and forward-looking tendency.

In 1867 Greene, in a statement of the peculiarities of his book, writes:

"So far as a text-book can do it, the pupil is made to use and apply his knowledge as fast as he acquires it, by means of exercises which compel him to think, write, and invent for himself."  

This tendency is of significance as to the general trend of thinking along these lines at this date in spite of the fact that, strangely enough, the author never asks the pupils to construct sentences or write compositions. In 1877 when Reed and Kellogg say in the preface of their book that "every principle unfolded in the Hints and every idiom, common construction, and form, learned by the pupil in analysis and parsing of the wide range of sentences given is fixed in memory and, above all, in practice by varied and exhaustive drill in composition", their statement is literally true. Regularly, following each lesson in which a new principle is taken up occur lessons marked Composition in which abundant exercises are provided for putting the new principle into immediate practical use as an aid in sentence mastery and correct usage.

In addition to their many exercises for the construction of sentences, Reed and Kellogg give over one division of their book to composition providing a more extended and more acceptable treatment of the subject than any of the other grammarians so far have done. Following rules and practice exercises for capital letters and punctuation of sentences, comes the section devoted to Qualities of Style in which perspicuity, energy, imagery, and variety are explained and briefly discussed. In these discussions the reader notes at once the absence of the pretentious flowery style of the earlier writers. The following statement in regard to perspicuity is clearer and less wordy than the definitions in Kirkham's text:

Perspicuity is opposed to obscurity and ambiguity, and so means clearness of expression. This is an indispensible quality; If the thought is not understood, it might as well have been left unuttered.  

Reed and Kellogg at one, in a sense, for beginning their chapter on composition by presenting these deadly discussions of qualities of style in that they provide exercises in which the pupil is asked to point out faults as you write, and other thoughts still occur in sentences and, better still, to recast sentences in accordance with the suggestions made in regard to style. This attempt to make sure that the pupil has understood strain after effect, or strive to seem wiser than you are. Use familiar words, and place them in your phrases, and your clauses where thought the clearest. As occasion calls, change from the natural

13 Ibid., p. 254.
the discussions and to show him how he can make practical use of what he has learned is a step in advance of the earlier writers who merely displayed the definitions and left the pupil to derive benefit from them as he could without any further assistance.

Reed and Kellogg divide the rest of the composition section into The Paragraph, Paragraphs and the Theme, and Analysis of the Subject of the Theme. This is the first mention that has been made of paragraphs in the writing of themes. Exercises are provided for dividing paragraphs into the separate facts of which they are composed and of noticing the relation of those facts. Other exercises consist of weaving given facts first into a paragraph and finally into several paragraphs or a theme. The closing section in the discussion presents directions for theme writing under the following headings: (1) choose a subject, (2) accumulate material, (3) construct a framework, (4) write, and (5) attend to the mechanical execution. In their directions for the writing of the theme, the authors say:

Give your whole attention to your work as you write, and other thoughts will occur to you, and better ways of putting the thoughts already noted down. In expanding the main points into paragraphs, be sure that everything falls under its appropriate head. Cast out irrelevant matter. Do not strain after effect, or strive to seem wiser than you are. Use familiar words, and place these, your phrases, and your clauses where they will make your thought the clearest. As occasion calls, change from the natural
order to the transposed and split sentences, simple, complex, and compound, long and short, stand shoulder to shoulder in the paragraph. Express yourself easily and only now and then putting your thoughts forcibly and with feeling. Let a fresh image here and there relieve the uniformity of plain language.

Although the directions are too comprehensive for the pupil to grasp and assimilate in one dose, as they are presented here, they do contain some good suggestions and are much more helpful to the student than was the indefinite appeal of the earlier texts for correct and elegant writing. They point to the time when composition assignments will be definitely and clearly stated. It is evident that much rhetorical formality is still expected of theme writing. That composition shows, nevertheless, a tendency to become a much more rational and interesting subject than it has been in the past is evident from the following theme subjects, the first twenty taken from the eighty-six listed:

1. Apples and Nuts
2. A Pleasant Evening
3. My Walk to School
4. Pluck
5. School Friendships
6. When My Ship Comes In
7. Ancient and Modern Warfare
8. The View from My Window
9. Homes Without Hands
10. I Can
11. My Friend Jack
12. John Chinaman
13. Irish Characters
14. Robin Hood
15. A Visit to Olympus
16. Monday Morning
17. My Native Town
18. Over the Sea
19. Up in a Balloon
20. Queer People

14 Ibid., p. 271-272.
15 Ibid., p. 273.
The majority of the books from 1877 to 1928 do not have separate divisions on composition. The writers of these books, which are grammars pure and simple, give evidence, nevertheless, that they are aware of the necessity of much original work in composition if the work in grammar is to function properly. In some instances they state that the book has been prepared to be used in conjunction with a book on composition. An examination of these texts shows that there is an ever greater tendency throughout the period to stress expression more than classification. Assignments in the construction of original illustrative sentences accompany all phases of grammar instruction in a constantly increasing degree. The new practice introduced by Reed and Kellogg, of making composition a purposeful study of real, vital interest to boys and girls is followed in the few texts before 1928 where composition is included and is fully developed in the grammar texts published in 1928 and 1929.

The table of contents in Tanner's text, published in 1928, shows that composition is no longer relegated to a short section at the end of the book as it was in the earlier texts. Instead, it has become a necessary and vital part of all grammar instruction. Suggestive of the importance which is being placed upon original expression is the fact that the word composition appears in the heading of four of the six divisions into which...
The book is divided: The Composition of Sentences, The Composition of Paragraphs, The Composition of Letters, and Composition for Immediate Use. Even in the test exercises for review and diagnosis before the text proper begins, composition is given a prominent place. Under the heading Tests of Skill in Composition are the two subtopics: Accuracy and Correctness in Composition and Accuracy, Correctness, and Speed in Composition. Under the first of these topics, the author writes:

In writing compositions we should see to it that what we say is accurately and correctly expressed. We may develop greater accuracy and correctness by paying close attention to the proper arrangement of our composition on paper and to such details as sentence structure, grammar, spelling, capitalization, punctuation, legibility, and neatness.

The simplicity with which the above statements are made is conspicuous in contrast to the bookish formality of expression in the older texts. The following statement under the second topic is also of interest here:

More and more it will be necessary for us to write under time restrictions. For this reason we should try to increase the speed with which we work, but we should not sacrifice accuracy, correctness, and clearness to speed.

This plan for testing out the pupils' skill before they begin the study of composition points to a new trend in
defective use of the subjunctive. A vein

---

17 Ibid., p. 28.
instruction. In order that emphasis may be placed properly, the grammarian provides for determining what particular help the individual child or class needs in securing accuracy and correctness of expression. A new tendency is apparent also in the suggestion that the pupil will be required to write under time restrictions. It is obvious that more human situations must be realized in composition assignments than were in those of the earlier days if the time for preparation is to be limited. It would be difficult to conceive of a time limit's being placed upon the writing of a theme on the subject of "Benevolence" for instance.

In the chapter The Composition of Sentences, Tanner makes the following statement as to his purpose:

This chapter will help us to develop skill in making our sentences correct and effective. Such skill we may acquire in two ways: (1) by constructing all kinds of sentences according to definite specifications and (2) by analyzing sentences of various types.

Of the two means of realizing this skill, he mentions first the construction of sentences. This is of interest in view of the fact that the earliest grammarians did not consider such an exercise necessary at any time. Of significance too is the fact that the writer has set as his goal effective instead of elegant sentences. He states

\[\text{ibid., p. 143.}\]
that good sentences must be correct, complete, clear, effective, and pleasing.

In the division, Composition of Paragraphs, after a clear explanation of what topic sentences and paragraphs are and a study of many illustrative paragraphs developed from topic sentences, many exercises follow which provide actually for developing topic sentences into original paragraphs. The following sentences illustrate the nature and appropriateness of the material provided:

The necessity of having to labor is mankind's greatest blessing.

As usual the unexpected happened.

Pupils find free-hand drawing helpful in many of their courses.

All the trouble resulted from a lie that I had told.\(^{19}\)

The following chapter titles in the section Composition for Immediate Use give evidence that the creative work provided is of a practical, usable nature:

Effective Speaking and Writing, Speaking and Writing to Inform, Speaking and Writing to Convince or Persuade, and Speaking and Writing to Entertain. Indicative of the fact that composition as presented here is a much more living subject than it was in the texts of the past, is the statement in the chapter Effective Speaking and Writing:

---

\(^{19}\) Ibid., p. 253.
We should realize, however, that doing these exercises, making recitations, giving talks before the class, writing compositions, and passing examinations are the means, not the end, of our study. Our goal is the development of the power of expression, the ability to say effectively what we have to say. In order to achieve our goal, we should make intelligent use of our present opportunities by striving to speak and write correctly and entertainingly on all occasions. Skill in the use of English is important in our social life and is one of the essentials of leadership in all the more desirable trades and professions.

The writer makes the pupil keenly sensitive to the fact that the value of composition work should extend far beyond the class room exercise. The following five essentials which the writer has selected for effective expression give further evidence of this same modern tendency of making instruction in composition sane and practical:

1. We must have something to say.
2. We should have a definite reason for saying it: (1) to inform, (2) to convince or persuade, (3) to entertain our hearers or readers.
3. We should adapt what we say to the understanding and interest of our hearers or readers.
4. We must do our best to make what we say clear and entertaining.
5. We must develop sufficient skill in the mechanics of composition to accomplish our purpose.

These suggestions indicate that the pupil is to have an

20 Ibid., p. 313.
21 Ibid., p. 314.
audience-minded attitude as he writes. Instead of being assigned a certain set subject -- such as The Cow, The Horse -- he is directed to search in his mind for topics in which he is interested and which he can make interesting to others.

Tanner's proposed steps in preparing a composition are much like those selected by Reed and Kellogg. They are: (1) Selecting a good subject, (2) Gathering the necessary material, (3) Arranging the material by means of an outline, (4) Developing the outline into a composition. The difference in the sections of the two texts lies in the handling of these topics. Under the first topic, Reed and Kellogg make the following more or less general statements:

Choose a subject. Choose your subject long before you are to write. Avoid a full, round term like Patriotism or Duty; take a fragment of it; as, How Can a Boy Be Patriotic? or Duties Which We School Mates Owe Each Other. The subject should be on your level, should be interesting to you and suggestive, and should instantly start in your mind many trains of thought.

The suggestions made here are valuable. This seems especially true when they are contrasted with the conventional, artificial directions given by the earlier writers. Yet there is a vagueness and an incompleteness

\footnotesize{
22 Ibid., p. 315.
}
in Reed and Kellogg's statements. Not only are they inadequate, but they are also too indefinite to direct satisfactorily the inexperienced young pupil in the selection of a suitable subject.

Tanner also discusses the selecting of subjects for compositions. He writes:

"A good subject is one that we fully understand. It should be thoroughly familiar to us from personal experience, observation, thinking, or reading. It should be one that interests us greatly and that will interest others if we present it effectively in an oral or written composition."

Most subjects when they first occur to us are too broad and general. They need to be limited before we can deal with them satisfactorily. In considering any subject, therefore, we should ask ourselves this question: Is it properly limited to fit my information, my ability, and the time and space allowed me? Suppose that we are thinking of "School Games" as a subject. We can see at once that it is too large. But if we limit it to "How to Play Scrimmage Ball", we have so reduced it in scope that we can probably discuss it clearly and entertainingly in a short talk or in a brief written composition. We indicate the limitation of a subject by the wording of the title.24

Then he supplements this discussion with the following helpful exercise:

Which of the subjects given below would you select for a short talk or a brief written composition? Indicate your second and third choice of subjects, and explain why your first choice is best.

1. My Favorite Pet 5. Why Our Team Should
2. A Narrow Escape Win the Next Game
3. Why Merchants Should Advertise in Our Paper
   Gift
4. The Best Book I Have Read 7. My Dog’s Best Trick
8. A subject of your own

Criticize the following subjects. Why are
those in the right column better than those
in the left? Which subject would you choose
for a short talk or a brief written composi-
tion? Why?

2. Education 7. Why I Like History
3. Thrift 8. Our School Bank

Derive two or more limited subjects from each of the following general subjects
that could be presented properly in a short talk of three or five minutes:

1. Inventions 6. Outdoor Sports
2. Automobile Accidents 7. Dogs
3. Contagious Diseases 8. Newspapers
5. Farm Life 10. Transportation

Tanner’s discussion is manifestly more helpful than is
Read and Kellogg’s because it is more definite and
explicit. After he tells the pupil in a general way how
the subject should be chosen, he lists many subjects and
provides class exercises for discussing the good points
and the weak points about each. By means of concrete
examples, he gives the pupil definite assistance in
learning how to choose a subject wisely.

_In the section Speaking and Writing to Inform_,

__Ibid., p. 315-316__.
Tanner discusses topics which have a direct practical appeal for the student, such as Taking Part in Conversations, Announcements and Notices, Giving Definitions, Making Recitations, Taking Examinations, Giving Short Talks, Giving Reports, Giving a Summary, Explaining Methods and Processes, and Discussing Facts and Ideas. The following are illustrative of the topics assigned for discussion under this last heading:

My Favorite Character in Fiction
The Importance of Music in One's Education
The Radio As a Means of Public Education
Do High-School Pupils Voluntarily Read Good Literature? 26

Again basing the subject matter of the texts on real situations and taking into account the interests of the pupils, the author provides exercises on the following topics: Telling Jokes, Relating Anecdotes, Relating Experiences, Describing What We Observe, Narrative Sketches of Persons and Animals, Writing Simple Narratives, Writing News Stories, Relating Legends and Folk Tales, Relating Myths, Relating Just-So Stories, Writing Short Stories.

The first indication of the stress which is placed upon opportunities for self-expression in Baker and Goddard's text is found in the table of contents. Instead of following the usual grammar text-book divisions

26Ibid., p. 363-364.
of subject matter, the writers have given the following interesting titles to the different lesson units into which the book is divided:

I With Nature  
II Mealtime  
III Myself  
IV My Country  
V Being a Citizen  
VI All around Town  
VII The Countryside  
VIII Not So Long Ago  
IX Wonders of Invention  
X Pets  
XI Some One I Know  
XII From Storyland  
XIII Fancies  
XIV At Work  
XV At Play  
XVI At Home  
XVII In Lands Afar  
XVIII Happenings  
XIX News of the Day  
XX Lines and Rhymes

The titles suggest at once interesting things which the class might talk or write about.

The composition section of each unit, supplementing a definite grammar study, begins with a composition model, a short literary selection. The appropriateness of the models selected and the aptness of the writers' comments tend to catch the interest of the pupil and make him conscious of certain experiences of his own to which he wishes to give expression. For example, the model used in the section based on Mealtime is Irving's description of a Dutch country tea table. The authors have given the selection the title An Autumn Banquet. Following this description are the writers' remarks which skilfully connect it with the children's own experience. They write:

Mealtime! Can you think of any subject which brings to your mind happier pictures? You can see your favorite dishes on the table; you can recall that last holiday or birthday dinner; you are looking forward to
eating the delicious food which Grandmother will place before you when you go to the country in vacation; or you are planning a picnic dinner for next week.27

Thus the thoughts of the child are directed not to a composition assignment but to some pleasurable meal which he remembers or anticipates. What child does not enjoy talking about good things to eat? Then the authors continue with such a delightful discussion of appropriate and suggestive words and expressions that the pupil's interest, as well as his appetite, is whetted.

Such a subject as mealtime requires many carefully selected words to do it justice,—words that suggest taste, smell, sound, and appearance. You will call to mind the crunch of celery and the sputter of roasting apples; you will seem to smell the roasting chicken, the piquant mince pies, and the savory sauces. In your stories about dinners, you will want to make the members of your class enjoy the meals, even though they were not at the table. If you use words that bring to their minds the memory of delicious tastes and tantalizing odors, you will succeed in "making their mouths water."

Here are some expressions that may help you. Try to think of many others:

golden brown roast chicken crisp celery
mellow chocolate odor light rolls
rich creamy gravy tart cranberries
spicy ham spongy cake
fluffy mashed potatoes refreshing ice

Here are some of the common comparisons that are used in connection with food:

Having secured the child's attention, the writers make interesting assignments in word study and précis writing before they take up the subject of composition.

The composition work in each division is devoted both to oral and written expression. Much significance is placed upon the exchange of ideas in the oral discussion, and the written work in each case consists of an assignment which has been definitely prepared for by the discussion which preceded it. Composition is no longer an individual matter. Group activity is emphasized. The writers create real situations which make the discussions natural and purposeful.

For example, after having enlisted the interest of the pupils in the subject Healtime, the writers insert the following exercise which scarcely seems like an exercise because of its human interest:

Suppose that your class is planning a picnic and that you are preparing for a meeting to discuss the plans.

A. Write at least two sentences upon each of the following:
Why I want to go to ———— for the picnic.
What we can do for entertainment.

26 Ibid., p. 33.
What we shall eat.
How to pack the lunch.
How we can avoid misfortunes of past picnics.

B. In the recitation, your teacher or a member of the class will act as chairman and call for your suggestions. Discuss only one point at a time and settle that one before you go on to another. It may be well for you to take notes on the best suggestions and on the decisions made by the members of the class.

The subjects which the authors provide for oral talks are such as to suggest the usual, ordinary experiences in the life of the child about which he can talk easily and naturally because he really has something to say. Illustrative of these subjects provided is the following exercise taken from the same unit, Mealtime:

From the suggestions given below choose a title, or make one to suit you, about which you can tell an incident. The girls will know more about subjects in connection with the preparation of a meal; the boys will know more about those that are related to marketing.

1. At Market the Day Before Christmas
2. The Boys Get Supper
3. At the Family Reunion
4. Our Kitchen on Saturday Morning
5. Autobiography of a Fork
6. The Tramp's Dinner
7. Mother's Baking Day
8. Over the Teacups
9. Breadtime Story
10. An Embarrassing Meal Before Christmas
11. A Surprise Dinner
12. Dessert Served the Day Behind the Scenes
13. Behind the Scenes
14. Food under Difficulties
15. Who Left the Refrigerator Door Open?
16. A Wedding Breakfast
17. Made It Myself
18. The Last Piece of Pie
19. My First Biscuits

---

29 Ibid., p. 34-35. 30 Ibid., p. 35.
Of especial interest in the assignment is the freedom which the writers permit the pupil when they direct him to use one of the titles they suggest or to use one of his own choosing. It scarcely seems possible, however, that at least one of the interesting array of titles which they present will not suggest some incident in the experience of each child about which he will be eager to tell the other children.

Paul and Miller, like Baker and Goddard, throughout their book have skilfully combined the study of grammar with actual practice in original expression. Grammar obviously has become a tool for use in giving accurate and effective expression to one's ideas. Their book is noteworthy in this study because of the emphasis which is laid upon the tendency to motivate exercises in speaking and writing. Instead of opening the composition work with definitions of qualities of style, as was the custom in earlier texts, they begin with an interesting discussion of what constitutes success in composition. The four secrets of success as here given are:

1. have plenty to say or write, (2) be eager to say or write it, (3) keep clearly in mind some definite hearer or reader, and (4) express the thought in good form. 31

---

Following this is a simple but persuasive discussion of the *North of Good Speech*. In anticipation of the difficulty the pupil will have in finding appropriate subjects for composition, the writers insert a section entitled *Interviewing Yourself*. In this connection they make the following assignment:

You may make out a list of topics on which you could talk to your classmates. Ask yourself the following questions and take plenty of time to think of as many good answers as you can. Do not be satisfied with going over this list once but return to it at least twice. Think of it during the course of the day and immediately note the ideas that come to you. You need not hand in these topics, but put them in such form that they will help you take part in the class discussion of this subject.

What is there of especial interest in your home life, or in the work of your parents? What are some of the things you have learned to do well? How could you, if necessary, contribute to the support of the family?

What games can you play well? How are these played? What are some very exciting games you have witnessed or in which you have played?

Have you some friends among the flowers and birds that live in your neighborhood? Have you had some interesting experiences in gardening?

What is your favorite school subject? Have you gained from it some information unknown to your classmates?

---

In this manner the authors touch every possible phase of the life and the interest of the pupil. By means of this assignment and the discussion which is to follow in class, he is made to see at the outset how much he really has to talk about. He discovers that he has had many experiences about which he would like to talk with others. At the same time he is made conscious of a specific audience. Here are boys and girls with whom he would like to match experiences. Composition is an activity of the group.

The writers provide natural instead of artificial situations in composition work and introduce many new devices for gaining the pupil's cooperation in making him feel that composition is to be a real, vital help to him. They recommend the organizing of an English club for the purpose of increasing the pupil's desire to speak and of securing a more attentive audience. They institute the custom of using what they call speech targets. The class determines what the three or four most serious defects are in the speech of the members of the class. They are placed on the board, and the entire class working together attempts to master them. These errors are no longer individual matters. The honor of the class is at stake. The socialized aims

---

33 Ibid., p. 31. 34 Ibid., p. 104.
of composition work are apparent in magazine assignments. The authors write:

Which magazines, weekly or monthly, do you read regularly? Which do you read occasionally? You will be interested in learning just what periodicals are read by the class, and how many members read each. You may write on a card the names of the magazines you read, listing those under the headings Regularly and Occasionally and hand this to your teacher who will appoint a committee to record the results and place these on the board.

The section headings Playing the Detective and Playing the Reporter suggest interesting human situations unknown in the earlier texts. With an understanding of human psychology, the authors provide campaigns for the purpose of improving everyday English. In these days of advertising, they recommend the use of a bulletin board to advertise good English. As a last exercise the writers suggest that the class as a whole work out a project as a service to the school. They propose that a book be prepared which will set forth all the advantages of their school and which will influence eighth grade pupils to wish to become members of it. Thus, throughout the book emphasis is placed upon natural, effective self-expression. To develop this appears to be the purpose of the book. Everything else is made subordinate to it.

---

The discussion in this chapter discloses the fact that opportunities for creative work became increasingly more abundant and more purposeful in the grammar text-books examined in this study. From 1829 to 1850 no provision whatever is made for any original writing on the part of the pupil. The writers' interest in grammar is entirely a classificatory one. In 1850, for the first time, exercises appear which provide for the writing of original sentences as illustrations of grammatical principles. Such exercises, however, are seldom used before 1877. Before that year, also, only three texts contain chapters which are devoted to instruction in composition work. The chapters, placed near the close of the book, apparently have no connection with the rest of the treatise. They consist of formal, elegantly phrased rehearsals and discussions of conventional definitions of qualities of style followed by theme assignments on abstract and generally impossible subjects remote from any knowledge, experience, or interest of the pupil. From 1877 to the end of the study in 1929, some provision is made in each text for having the pupil construct original illustrative sentences. Through the years grammarians stress expression more and more and place less emphasis on classification. By 1877 composition has become a somewhat more rational study. The discussions of qualities of style are more simply expressed
and illustrative material is included so that the definitions are more intelligible to the pupil than they were in the earlier texts. Although the assignments for composition writing are still somewhat vague, the theme subjects are not entirely foreign to the experience of the pupil and some of them should be interesting. Although after 1900 provision is made consistently in all of the texts for the writing of many original illustrative sentences, composition as such is not made an important feature until near the end of the century. In the books published in 1928 and 1929, composition has become a real, integral part of all work in grammar. In fact the grammar is obviously used as a means for procuring effective expression in the composition work which follows. No effort is spared to create real, live situations so that the composition lesson will have a purpose and will have practical results. The writers lead up to the composition assignments by explicit, helpful suggestions and directions and by presenting appropriate and interesting models. The composition subjects are varied and always suggestive of experiences which normal boys and girls have usually had. The writers make provision for much group activity in composition work. Oral and written composition work together hand-in-hand. Usually the subjects for written work are discussed orally first so that the pupil has the advantage and
incentive of an exchange of ideas with his classmates. The goal of the text is to give effective and pleasing expression to original ideas.
PART III

CONCLUSION

In the preceding analysis of the early grammar tests described, certain tendencies in the presentation of the subject of grammar which seem to justify the conclusion that grammar tests used today should function in the everyday speech-writing of the mail letter, that did those used one hundred years ago. Although modern education, in the direction of professional literature, seems to have, with as much of the earlier writers, that the study of grammar is not succeeding in the realization of correct speech as one part of their pupils' thirty text-books during its publication from 1879 to 1929, only one subjectively examined in this study, that's concluded through the procedure which, in my view, should result in progressively increasing functional value. The grammarians in turn have followed new trends which seem to provide, as far as the text-book is concerned, an ever greater opportunity for the ordinary pupil through the study of grammar to improve his speech and furthermore to offer him an ever-greater incentive to wish to do so. Although
The preceding analysis of the thirty grammar texts disclosed changing tendencies in the presentation of the subject of grammar which seem to justify the conclusion that grammar texts used today should function in the everyday speech and writing of the pupil better than did those used one hundred years ago. Although modern educators in their discussions in periodical literature lament the fact, quite as much as did earlier writers, that the study of grammar is not succeeding in the realization of correct speech on the part of the pupil, the thirty text-books dating in publication from 1829 to 1929, which were critically examined in this study, show a continuous change in procedure which, it would seem, should result in progressively increasing functional value. The grammarians in turn have followed new trends which seem to provide, so far as the text-book is concerned, an ever greater opportunity for the ordinary pupil through the study of grammar to improve his speech and furthermore to offer him an ever greater incentive to wish to do so. Although
the changes in the texts have naturally been gradual throughout the century, the contrast between the first and the last of the grammars studied is exceedingly great. These changing tendencies, which were traced in detail in Part II of this dissertation, may be summarized as follows:

1. The grammar of today, with its attractive binding, its excellent quality of paper, its interesting illustrations, and its peculiar individuality, must make an appeal to boys and girls which the unadorned, highly technical, conventional grammar of one hundred years ago could not have made. The large distinct type and the inclusion of an exhaustive index make the present-day grammar a much more usable and acceptable text than was the book of a century ago.

2. Correct speech is the aim of the grammarian today as it was one hundred years ago. Grammar, however, is now conceived not as the art of correct speech but as the science of the language underlying the art. In the past, the study of grammar consisted of an exceedingly complicated and thoughtless reproduction of text-book forms with apparently no conscious consideration as to how the art of correct speech was to be realized. The pupil was given a knowledge which could express itself only in definition. Today grammar is looked upon as only one, though a very vital one, of the forces that aid in the development of the power of expression. The
pupil is given a knowledge of the language which will be of assistance to him in the acquisition and use of good English in the expression of his own thoughts and his ability to understand the thoughts of others.

3. The subject matter of grammar today is much less comprehensive and all-inclusive than it was one hundred years ago. Orthography and prosody are no longer regarded as a part of the subject of grammar and only so much of etymology is included as functions in every day speech. In the past, grammarians attempted to present an exhaustive, technical study of the grammar of the English language. Today only those facts of grammar are included in a text-book which need to be understood in order to give the pupil a sense of security when his feeling or ear for the correct form fails him. Diagnostic tests determine which of the relatively few facts presented in the grammar need especial drill by each pupil. Today constructive oral and written exercises supplement all grammar work.

4. Today the number of grammatical rules to be learned has been greatly diminished. In the past, grammar consisted almost entirely of committing to memory rules and definitions with their numerous exceptions to be used in mechanical parsing and exercises in false syntax, a mere deadly repetition without significance or purpose. Today stress is laid upon the
effort to make the pupil understand the thought which is expressed in the definition. If he understands the principle, he should be able to state it; but it makes no difference whether he uses his own words or the words of the book.

5. The sentences provided for drill purposes today are of such a nature as to stimulate the interest of the pupil and add to the pleasure of the study of grammar. They present a contrast to the pedantic sentences in the exercises of the grammars of the past which strove to teach a moral lesson.

6. Opportunities for practice in giving expression to original thought are much more numerous now than they were one hundred years ago. In the past, very little provision was made for creative work of any kind. Composition, when it was included at all in the subject matter, was of a formal, abstract, artificial nature. The writers' chief aims appeared to be rhetorical correctness and style. Today the realization of original, spontaneous expression is the goal of the grammarian. Grammar is a tool, the value of which is measured by the degree to which it is an aid to the pupil in acquiring the ability to give expression to his thoughts in correct and effective form. Composition, as it is presented in text-books today, provides opportunity for the expression of the pupil's own interests and a means for the interpretation of his own experience.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

ARTICLES


Harap, Henry. 'Functional Grammar.' *School and Society*, XIII (1921), p. 73-75.


Johnson, W. H. The Deterioration of College English. 
Kellogg, Walter Guest. Is Grammar Useless? North
American Review, CCXII (1920), p. 36-42.
Lang, S. E. Modern Teaching of Grammar. Educational
Leonard, Sterling A. English Teaching Faces the Future.
Lewis, Frances W. The High School Course in English.
Liddell, Mark H. On the Teaching of English. Atlantic,
Livingston, Arthur. The Myth of Good English. Century,
Mathes, C. H. The Changing Methods of Instruction in
English. Education, XLIII (1922), p. 73-82.
Mayhew, Zeta Cook. The Question of Teaching English.
Mones, Leon. A Word on Formal Grammar. Education,
XLIV (1923), p. 234-236.
Norris, Orland O. Why Hate English? Educational
Peck, H. T. What Is Good English? Bookman, VII (1898),
p. 125-130.
Phillips, J. N. A Plea for Accurate English. Writer,
XIII (1900), p. 33-35.


Taylor, J. S. Inconsistencies in the Present Attitude toward Grammar. School and Society, XXV (1927), p. 239-244.


BOOKS


Kerl, Simon. A Comprehensive Grammar of the English Language for Use in Schools.¹


Lyte, Eliphalet Gram. Grammar and Composition for Common Schools."¹


¹Complete bibliographical reference cannot be given. Book no longer available; withdrawn from the library because of age.


### APPENDIX A

**LIST OF BOOKS WITH AUTHORS AND DATES OF PUBLICATION**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date of Publication</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1829</td>
<td>Kirkham, Samuel</td>
<td>English Grammar in Familiar Lectures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1846</td>
<td>Butler, Noble</td>
<td>A Practical Grammar of the English Language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1850</td>
<td>Finneo, T. S.</td>
<td>Analytical Grammar of the English Language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1856</td>
<td>Brown, Goold</td>
<td>Institutes of English Grammar Methodically Arranged</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1861</td>
<td>Kerl, Simon</td>
<td>A Comprehensive Grammar of the English Language for the Use of Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1862</td>
<td>Bullions, Peter</td>
<td>An Analytical and Practical Grammar of the English Language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1867</td>
<td>Greene, Samuel S.</td>
<td>A Grammar of the English Language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1873</td>
<td>Holbrook, Alfred</td>
<td>An English Grammar Conformed to Present Usage with an Objective Method of Teaching the Elements of the English Language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1876</td>
<td>Bosworth, Marcus</td>
<td>A Practical Grammar of the English Language Synthetic and Analytic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1877</td>
<td>Swinton, William</td>
<td>A Grammar Containing the Etymology and Syntax of the English Language for Advanced Grammar Grades and for High Schools, Academies, Etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Author</td>
<td>Title</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1877</td>
<td>Whitney, William D.</td>
<td>Essentials of English Grammar for the Use of Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1877</td>
<td>Reed, Alonzo</td>
<td>A Work on English Grammar and Composition in Which the Science of Language Is Made Tributary to the Art of Expression</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kellogg, Brainerd</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1880</td>
<td>Ridpath, John Clark</td>
<td>An Inductive Grammar of the English Language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1886</td>
<td>Lyte, Eliphalet O.</td>
<td>Grammar and Composition for Common Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1890</td>
<td>Rigdon, Jonathan</td>
<td>Grammar of the English Sentence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1895</td>
<td>Baskerville, W. M.</td>
<td>An English Grammar for the Use of High School, Academy, and College Classes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sewell, J. W.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1896</td>
<td>Wisely, J. B.</td>
<td>A New English Grammar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1897</td>
<td>Earle, John</td>
<td>A Simple Grammar of English Now in Use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1900</td>
<td>Milne, James M.</td>
<td>An English Grammar for the Use of Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1907</td>
<td>Baker, Josephine</td>
<td>Correct English How to Use It, A Complete Grammar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Turk</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1908</td>
<td>Bernald, James C.</td>
<td>A Working Grammar of the English Language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1914</td>
<td>Blount, Alma</td>
<td>An English Grammar for Use in High and Normal Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Northup, Clark</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sutherland</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1914</td>
<td>Dengler, Walter E.</td>
<td>Lessons and Exercises in English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Author(s)</td>
<td>Title</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1917</td>
<td>Ward, C. H.</td>
<td>Sentence and Theme - A Foundation for High School Composition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1921</td>
<td>Frazee, Susan Isabel Wells, Chauncey Wetmore</td>
<td>Grammar and Practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1922</td>
<td>Cross, E. A.</td>
<td>The Little Grammar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1923</td>
<td>Hoyt, Mary Wilkins Hoyt, Florence Stevens</td>
<td>Grammar by Practice an Aid to Thinking and Writing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1928</td>
<td>Tanner, William M.</td>
<td>Correct English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1928</td>
<td>Baker, Rannie B. Goddard, Mabel</td>
<td>English Fundamentals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1929</td>
<td>Paul, Harry G. Miller, William D.</td>
<td>English Essentials for the High School</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## APPENDIX B

### DEFINITIONS OF GRAMMAR IN CHRONOLOGICAL ORDER WITH NAMES OF GRAMMARIANS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grammarian</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Definition of Grammar</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kirkham</td>
<td>1829</td>
<td>English grammar is the art of speaking and writing the English language with propriety.(^1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Butler</td>
<td>1846</td>
<td>English grammar treats of the principles of the English Language.(^2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pinneo</td>
<td>1850</td>
<td>English grammar is the art of speaking and writing the English language according to established usage.(^3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brown</td>
<td>1856</td>
<td>English grammar is the art of speaking, reading, and writing the English language correctly.(^4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kerl</td>
<td>1861</td>
<td>English grammar teaches how to speak and write the English language correctly.(^5)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^1\)Kirkham, Samuel. *English Grammar in Familiar Lectures*, p. 18.  
\(^3\)Pinneo, T. S. *Analytical Grammar of the English Language*, p. 7.  
\(^5\)Karl, Simon. *A Comprehensive Grammar of the English Language for the Use of Schools*. (Page reference cannot be given; book withdrawn from library because of age.)
English grammar is the art of speaking and writing the English language with propriety.  

English grammar treats of the principles and usages of the English language; it teaches us to speak and write correctly.

English grammar -- That branch which treats of the English language.

English grammar teaches how to understand and use the English language.

English grammar is the science that treats of the principles of the English language. Its use or end is to teach the art of speaking the English language correctly.

English grammar is a description of the good and approved usages of the English language.

---

6 Bullions, Peter. *An Analytical and Practical Grammar of the English Language*, p. 3.
8 Holbrook, Alfred. *An English Grammar Conformed to Present Usage with an Objective Method of Teaching the Elements of the English Language*, p. 5.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reed and Kellogg</td>
<td>1877</td>
<td>English grammar is the science which teaches the forms, uses, and relations of the words of the English language.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ridpath</td>
<td>1880</td>
<td>English grammar is the art of speaking and writing the English language according to its Law and Usage.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lyte</td>
<td>1886</td>
<td>Grammar is the science that treats of the relations and forms of words and sentences as used in correct expression of thought.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rigdon</td>
<td>1890</td>
<td>Grammar is the study of the sentence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baskerville and Sewell</td>
<td>1895</td>
<td>English grammar is the science which treats of the nature of words, their forms, their uses, and relations in the sentence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wisely</td>
<td>1896</td>
<td>Grammar is that language study which has for its subject matter or unit the sentence.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

14 Lyte, E. O. Grammar and Composition for Common Schools. (Page Reference cannot be given; book withdrawn from library because of age.)
17 Wisely, J. B. A New English Grammar, p. 41.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Earles</td>
<td>1897</td>
<td>No definition as such given. (The first aim of grammar is to determine the function of each word in the sentence.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Milne</td>
<td>1900</td>
<td>An investigation of the facts, processes, and usages of a language is called Grammar.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baker</td>
<td>1907</td>
<td>Grammar is the scientific conformity of spoken and written words to the thought and feeling to be expressed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fernald</td>
<td>1908</td>
<td>Grammar is the treatment of words in their relations as used for the expression of thought.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blount and Northup</td>
<td>1914</td>
<td>No definition given. (The study of grammar is, at bottom, chiefly a study of the relations of the ideas comprehended in a thought.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dengler</td>
<td>1914</td>
<td>No definition given. (The aim of the book is to give students a better use of the English language.)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

19 Milne, James M. An English Grammar for the Use of Schools, p. 2.
21 Fernald, James C. A Working Grammar of the English Language, p. IX.
22 Blount, Alma and Northup, Clark Sutherland. An English Grammar for Use in High and Normal Schools, p. 6.
23 Dengler, Walter H. Lessons and Exercises in English, p. V.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ward</td>
<td>1917</td>
<td>No definition given.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frazee and</td>
<td>1921</td>
<td>Grammar is that science of language which defines its parts and states the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wells</td>
<td></td>
<td>laws governing their uses in the sentence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cross</td>
<td>1922</td>
<td>The science which observes the customs followed in making our English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>sentences and which arranges these observations in an orderly way so that</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>we may refer to them when in doubt about how to speak or write a sentence,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>is English grammar.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hoyt and</td>
<td>1923</td>
<td>No definition given.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hoyt</td>
<td></td>
<td>(The aim of grammar is to make the child familiar with the construction of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>his language.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tanner</td>
<td>1928</td>
<td>No definition given.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(In order to speak and write correctly we should have an accurate knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>of grammar and employ this knowledge intelligently in devising and revising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>our sentences.)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

26 Cross, E. A. The Little Grammar, p. 3.
27 Hoyt, Mary Wilkins and Hoyt, Florence Stevens. Grammar by Practice, p. VII.
28 Tanner, William N. Correct English, p. 2.
Baker and Goddard 1928

No definition given.
(The work in grammar is restricted to fundamentals, with emphasis upon the sentence and the correction of common grammatical errors.)

Paul and Miller 1929

No definition given.
(Emphasis should be placed on the mastery of that central unit of composition, the sentence.)

### APPENDIX C

**SUBJECT MATTER AND ARRANGEMENT AS SHOWN BY MAIN DIVISIONS OF TEXT-BOOKS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Text-Book</th>
<th>1829</th>
<th>1846</th>
<th>1850</th>
<th>1856</th>
<th>1861</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kirkham</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Butler</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pinnee</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brown</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kerl</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Orthography</th>
<th>Orthography</th>
<th>Orthography</th>
<th>Orthography</th>
<th>Part I Etymology &amp; Syntax (Not so named)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Etymology and Syntax</th>
<th>Orthoepy</th>
<th>Etymology</th>
<th>Etymology</th>
<th>Part II Etymology &amp; Syntax (Not so named)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Appendix:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Versification</th>
<th>Rhetoric</th>
<th>Composition</th>
<th>Figures of Speech</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Etymology</td>
<td>Syntax</td>
<td>Syntax</td>
<td>Versification</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Syntax</th>
<th>Prosody</th>
<th>Prosody</th>
<th>Analysis of Sentences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Composition</th>
<th>Prosody</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bullions 1862</td>
<td>Greene 1867</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orthography</td>
<td>Orthography</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Etymology</td>
<td>Etymology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Syntax</td>
<td>Syntax</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prosody</td>
<td>Prosody</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Composition</td>
<td>Prosody</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Book a grammar pure and simple. Author recommends that it be taken in connection with his School Composition.*
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Whitney 1877</th>
<th>Reed and Kellogg 1877</th>
<th>Ridpath 1880</th>
<th>Lyte 1886</th>
<th>Rigdon 1890</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Sentence: the Parts of Speech</td>
<td>Sentence and the Parts of Speech</td>
<td>Etymology</td>
<td>Elements of Speech (Parts of Speech &amp; Sentence)</td>
<td>Introduction of Properties of Parts of Speech, Sentences, Phrases, Clauses.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inflection &amp; Classification of Parts of Speech</td>
<td>Parts of Speech Subdivided</td>
<td>Syntax</td>
<td>Elements &amp; Analysis of Sentences</td>
<td>Parts of Speech</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Syntax</td>
<td>Modifications of Parts of Speech</td>
<td>Prosody</td>
<td>Position of Parts of Speech</td>
<td>Analysis of Sentences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Composition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parts of Speech</td>
<td>Baskerville and Sewell 1896</td>
<td>Wisely 1896</td>
<td>Earle 1897</td>
<td>Milne 1900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of Sentences</td>
<td>Classes of Sentences</td>
<td>Syntax</td>
<td>Modifications and Relations of Parts of Speech</td>
<td>Classification and Properties of Parts of Speech</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Syntax</td>
<td>Classes &amp; Uses of Words</td>
<td>Prosody</td>
<td>Sentence Structure</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Combination of Words, Phrases &amp; Clauses</td>
<td>Prose Composition</td>
<td>Syntax</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parts of Speech</td>
<td>Sentences for Analysis</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literary Selections for Illus. in Grammar</td>
<td>Opportunity for Imitation Ideal in Writing Topics in Composition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fernald</td>
<td>Blount &amp; Northup</td>
<td>Dengler</td>
<td>Ward</td>
<td>Frazee and Wells</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1908</td>
<td>1914</td>
<td>1914</td>
<td>1917</td>
<td>1921</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parts of Speech &amp; the Sentence</td>
<td>Parts of Speech</td>
<td>Sentence</td>
<td>Construction of Single Words Aiming at Goal in Themes</td>
<td>Introductory View of Sentence and Parts of Speech</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building of the Sentence</td>
<td>Sentences</td>
<td>Parts of Speech</td>
<td>Parts of Simple Sentences. One Topic in Each Theme</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sentences</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Subordinate Clauses Orderly Letters &amp; Themes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sentence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>All Types of Sentences. Coherence in Themes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Analysis</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

...
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cross</th>
<th>Hoyt and Hoyt 1923</th>
<th>Tanner 1928</th>
<th>Baker and Goddard 1928</th>
<th>Paul and Miller 1929</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Elements of a Sentence</td>
<td>Parts of Speech</td>
<td>Text Exercises for Review &amp; Diagnosis</td>
<td>Sentence and Its Parts</td>
<td>Sentences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Parts of Speech &amp; Their In-</td>
<td>The Forms of Words, Classification</td>
<td>Parts of Speech in Sentence</td>
<td>Parts of Speech</td>
<td>Parts of Speech *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>flections &amp; Functions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sentence Analysis</td>
<td>Some Questions of Usage</td>
<td>Composition of Sentences</td>
<td>Sentence Review &amp; Drill</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Materials for Reference, Punctuation, Common Errors, Slang.</td>
<td>Grammar Games &amp; Plays</td>
<td>Composition of Paragraphs</td>
<td>*Each grammar lesson is combined with lessons in word study, precise writing, and oral and written composition.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Composition of Letters</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| | | Composition for Immediate Use. | *
| | | Study of Words | Every other chapter is devoted to composition. |